I Want to Be in That Number: A Song Profile of "When the Saints Go Marching In"

Gregory H. Jacks
Syracuse University
I Want to Be in That Number: A Song Profile of "When the Saints Go Marching In"

A Capstone Project Submitted in Partial Fulfillment of the Requirements of the Renée Crown University Honors Program at Syracuse University

By Gregory Heisler Jacks
Candidate for Bachelor of Arts Degree in Anthropology and Renée Crown University Honors May 2015

Honors Capstone Project in Music History and Literature

Capstone Project Advisor: Théo Catelonis, Professor

Capstone Project Reader: Jenny Doughty, Professor

Honors Director: Stephen Kausisto, Director

Date: April 22, 2015
Abstract

“When the Saints Go Marching In” has never been subject to a sustained study of its origins, disseminations, and current manifestations. A study like this, focused on a song’s perceptions via various viewpoints through time, is typically referred to as a song profile; a form of reception history specifically concentrated on a single musical composition. “When the Saints Go Marching In,” also known as “Saints” or “The Saints,” is an African-American spiritual typically listed as a traditional in most songbooks without a composer.¹ I have laid out this paper into four sections, one for each period of the song’s history. The first chapter discusses the origins of the tune; examining spirituals, brass bands, claims to authorship, and its early recordings. Chapter two describes Louis Armstrong’s contribution to the song, and its rise in popularity during the Dixieland Revival of the 1940s and 50s. The following chapter comments on the emergence of “Saints” as a New Orleans cliché and the growth of tourism and economic disparity in the city. The final chapter explores the song’s use in children’s music education in the United States. I used Sheryl Kaskowitz’s book God Bless America: The Surprising History of an Iconic Song, a song profile on Irving Berlin’s “God Bless America,” as inspiration for this study.

¹ I will refer to “When the Saints Go Marching In” as “Saints” frequently in this paper, as it is a common shorthand for the tune, used by both musicians and scholars.
Executive Summary

“I am interested in pursuing a project that utilizes the Belfer sound archive and other collections of early American popular music off campus. I am not entirely sure what the project will consist of, but I know I want to focus on some sort of American roots music. Whether it be jazz, blues, americana, folk, country, bluegrass, rock n' roll, I'm not sure.”

Introduction

The project below is the culmination of the last two years of my undergraduate education. The above quote was the initial seed for the Capstone, an idea which I emailed to Professor Theo Cateforis in early November of 2013. When we first met, I had little vision of what I wanted to focus on. I knew I wanted to study American music, culture, and history but had no idea of which part of American music, culture or history I wanted to study. I also felt compelled to use the resources at the Belfer Audio Archive, among the largest sound archives in the United States, for my research but had no idea of what I should access or even how to access it.\(^2\) I was not even sure what the final project would look like. I went from envisioning a musical showcase of Appalachian folk music to a display of the Belfer Archive’s un-catalogued sound recordings. It was a chaotic jumble of overambitious ideas that was quelled only by Professor Cateforis’ suggestion that I read a song profile. A song profile is a form of reception history which looks at the changing styles, uses, derivations, performances, popularity, and disseminations of a particular composition as it is perceived through various viewpoints.

Sheryl Kaskowitz’s *God Bless America: The Surprising History of an Iconic Song*, is the main inspiration behind the formation of this paper. Her book chronicles the lyrical evolution of Irving Berlin’s American pop tune from its pre-WWII sentiment to its post-9/11 revitalization. The concept that a simple song, so engrained in Americans minds, could have such a complex

\(^2\) The archive, located adjacent to Bird Library on campus has a total of 330,000 items, including 78rpm records and 22,000 wax cylinders, the predecessor of the record.
and dynamic history excited me. I began to think of other “American classics” that would have similarly interesting trajectories. “When Johnny Comes Marching Home,” “Home on the Range,” “This Land Is Your Land,” are just some of the tunes that came to mind. I ended up settling on “When the Saints Go Marching In” because of my love of jazz music. Being a jazz pianist, I was really into Dr. John’s version of the song at the time, and figured there were a variety of unique interpretations of the song that I would get to discover via this project. I was also interested in studying “When the Saints Go Marching In” because of my fascination with New Orleans. Before visiting, as part of research for this project, I would always refer to the Big Easy as my favorite city I had never been to. I was, and still am to an extent, obsessed with the fantasy of the city. I am in love with the idea of New Orleans as a mythical city, a hotbed of expressive music and the birthplace of jazz, where soulful melodies creep out from every street corner. Although the actual city is far less idyllic, the chance to study both jazz music and New Orleans had me hooked, and “Saints” became the subject.

Overview

As mentioned previously, this paper is a song profile drawing influence from Kaskowitz’s book. Each chapter describes a different period of the history of “Saints.” Beginning with nineteenth century black America, chapter one discusses the origins of African-American spirituals and “Saints” as an example of early hymns of the black church. Then it moves into a description of the New Orleans jazz funeral, and the importance “Saints” played as a parade tune. Next, I explore the possibility of authorship of the tune and discuss its earliest recorded forms. After this, I emphasize Louis Armstrong and his 1938 recording of the song, as it marks the transition of the song from spiritual to jazz standard. This second chapter goes into
greater detail on the song as an example of the Dixieland Revival, a renaissance of early jazz which lasted from the late 1930s into the 1950s. The third chapter talks about “Saints” in one of its more modern contexts, specifically as a New Orleans cliché. Played to death for so many years in the city, many New Orleans musicians disdain the tune, playing it only as crowd-pleasing pander for unimaginative tourists. I use this idea to discuss current issues in New Orleans both pre and post-Katrina, where an economy reliant on tourism fails to give back to the people that really make it an appealing place to visit—the musicians.

The fourth and final chapter of the thesis dissects “Saints” in its other modern context as an educational tool. I first learned the song during an elementary school piano lesson, and so have many other American children. A friend of mine actually cringed when I mentioned I was doing a research project on the tune, because it reminded her of an unpleasantly strict piano instructor from grade school. Nevertheless, the song has become a staple in the American musical education system as a way for instructors to teach the rudiments of marching, improvisation, and jazz music.

Research Methods

This project engages both primary and secondary resources. I started my research by looking at a few books specifically on Louis Armstrong and New Orleans jazz. At the suggestion of Professor Cateforis, I read *Hear Me Talkin To Ya* edited by Nat Shapiro and Nat Hentoff, a collection of quotes from famous jazz musicians chronicling the genre’s history, and Richard Brent Turner’s *Jazz Religion, the Second Line, and Black New Orleans*. These books gave me a fairly broad idea of what lives were like for African-American musicians during the turn of the
twentieth century. In addition to this, I read a blogpost on “Saints” origins and articles about the supposed composers.

In order to hone in on Armstrong, I went through all of Bird Library’s books on him, and hunted the indexes for “Saints.” I flagged each mention of the tune in over a dozen books. I followed this same procedure with other publications, on New Orleans tourism, jazz funerals, and Mardi Gras. These print and online sources gave me baseline knowledge of the subject matter. As I narrowed in my search, I ended up accessing a variety of print and online sources, including: books, blogposts, sheet music, dissertations, encyclopedias, discographies, bibliographies, journal entries, CD liner notes, magazine articles, newspaper articles, music recordings, webpages, and DVDs/VHS. I accessed these materials both on and off of Syracuse University’s campus at: Syracuse University Libraries, including Bird Library and the Belfer Audio Archive, the Martin Luther King Jr. Memorial Library, the Library of Congress, and Tulane University’s Hogan Jazz Archive and Howard-Tilton Memorial Library.

A method I used throughout this project was scanning discographies of early jazz, country, gospel, and African-American musicians in search of lesser-known recordings of “Saints.” These discographies helped me put the 1938 recording by Armstrong in context, by shining light on the tune’s earliest recorded forms from the 1920s and 1930s. Although not every one of these recordings is available in digitized form, many have been digitized and are available online through Library of Congress or the Belfer Audio Archive, accessible on YouTube, or can be found on CD. The Belfer Archive digitized ten 78 rpm recordings of “Saints” not available online for me. This process took several months, as I had to scan their catalogue and request the items in advance and then wait for them to be digitized. This lengthy process was highly
valuable however, as I was able to listen to versions of the song I would have otherwise never had access to.

In addition to completing work with archival material at Belfer, I also visited the Hogan Jazz Archive at Tulane University. There I went through a vertical file on “Saints,” original sheet music, CDs, 78s, DVDs, and dissertations. The staff was very helpful and receptive constantly bringing me to new resources to propel the thesis. Unfortunately I could not visit all the libraries which had useful materials, so I used interlibrary loan to access these off-site resources. Edward Boatner’s *Spirituals Triumphant: Old and New*, the first-known songbook to publish “Saints” in sheet music, was one such item I requested through the interlibrary loan system.

On top of archival and library resources I also did some primary research by making a trip to New Orleans over spring break. During my four-day stay, I conducted three interviews, took dozens of pictures, walked around the city, and videotaped sections of a second line parade. This brand of ethnography helped expand the scope of the project, as I was able to really appreciate the role “Saints” plays amongst the city’s musicians and scholars. It was also important to physically see the spaces I had studied, to interpret them through my own lens.³

**Conclusion**

I would like to finish by saying that I do not attempt to answer overarching questions like who wrote “Saints,” or whether or not New Orleans’ musicians will find it less clichéd in the future? The importance of this thesis is not in answering assumptive queries like that. Rather, my

³ Visiting both Louis Armstrong Park and the French Quarter gave me a better idea for where the true “tourist playgrounds” lie. Although the quarter is a tourist haven, the park was quite dead, with boarded up buildings, it only recently reopened after damage from Hurricane Katrina. I also got to see George Lewis’ former home where he and Bunk Johnson recorded “Saints” in 1945 (see Appendix)
research is important because it is an altogether original study. Although there are some writings on the tune’s history, there is no song profile on “Saints,” this is the first. I have tried my best to combine the work of scholars in many well-researched topics, to focus on “Saints” presence in a myriad of cultural realms.

For those not aware of: problems faced by post-Emancipation African Americans, modern New Orleans economical and social issues, and jazz musical traditions; this thesis should also provide a background for further pursuit of those topics. Lastly, this thesis is ever-growing. Just one semester in, and I knew I would not get to everything I had envisioned. Specifically, I would like to expand on the song’s post-Katrina life as an anthem for the city and its prized football team. Following graduation, I hope to continue work on this song profile of “Saints,” making adjustments to further the accuracy and significance of this thesis.
Table of Contents

Abstract..................................................................................................................iii
Executive Summary.................................................................................................iv
Acknowledgments...................................................................................................xi
Introduction............................................................................................................xii

Chapter 1: The Origins of Saints............................................................................1
  Saints as a Spiritual...............................................................................................1
  New Orleans: The Jazz Funeral and the Second Line.........................................4
  Claims to Composition.........................................................................................9
  The Early Recordings............................................................................................11
  The Jubilee Recordings of the mid-1920s............................................................12
  Recordings by Bluesmen.......................................................................................14
  Early 1930s Folk and Hillbilly Renditions.........................................................15

Chapter 2: Louis Armstrong, the Jazz Era, and Dixieland Revival......................17
  The Dixieland Revival.........................................................................................19
  The 1938 Decca Recording................................................................................21
  Reverend Satchelmouth.......................................................................................22
  Immediate Impact of 1938 Recording................................................................24
  The All Stars and Saints Internationally............................................................26
  “Just A Boy From New Orleans:” Louis Armstrong’s Final Years.....................28

Chapter 3: Saints and the Growth of New Orleans Tourism..............................32
  Saints as “Tourist Bait”......................................................................................32
  Saints in a City of Sinners..................................................................................35
  The Commodification of Jazz.............................................................................37
  The Modern Importance of the Second Line....................................................40
  Economic Struggles of the New Orleans Musician...........................................42

Chapter 4: Saints and Children’s Music Education..............................................45
  The Diffusion of Saints in Early Twentieth Century New Orleans....................45
  Saints and Family Music-Making.......................................................................46
  Saints and the Development of American Music Education............................48
  Uses of Saints in Music Education Literature................................................49

Conclusion.............................................................................................................52
Appendix..................................................................................................................55
  Second Line Parade Route Map.........................................................................55
  Edward Boatner Sheet Music...............................................................................56
  Black and Purvis Sheet Music............................................................................58
  Spring Break Trip Photographs.........................................................................59

Works Cited.............................................................................................................66
Acknowledgments

This paper reflects the outcome of not just my work, but the work of many people and their contributions. First and foremost, I would like to thank my advisor, Prof. Theo Cateforis, who steered me on track for the entirety of this project. Whenever I started to veer away from the direction of the paper, he would refocus my attention. His time and effort was vital, turning this project from a conversational piece into an academic paper. I’ll always remember his suggestion to write whilst researching. I would also like to thank my Honors’ Reader, Prof. Jenny Doctor, who helped me date and access recordings as well as edit the final draft of the paper. I am also grateful for the generous monetary contributions of the Music History and Literature Department, Anthropology Department, and the Renee Crown Honors Program, which helped me fund my spring break trip to New Orleans. Of course, I am also thankful for the contributions of my father, Philip Jacks, for covering the rest of the trip, and, let’s not forget, my college tuition.

Of the New Orleans’ contributors to this project, I would especially like to thank Prof. Matt Sakakeeny for meeting with me and helping more solidly frame the tourism chapter. I would additionally like to thank the following people from Louisiana: Art Perry, Asher Ross, Bruce Raeburn, Alaina Hubert, David Maxson, and Lynn Abbott.

Lastly I want to list all the friends, colleagues, and professors who provided moral support and educational guidance: Prof. Deborah Pellow, Prof. Carol Babiracki, Prof. John Burdick, Prof. John Coggiola, Hanna Richardson, Alex Selden, Jessica Culver, Juliette Crellin, Tom Anderau, Naomi Flores, Patrick Dwyer, and Dan Franco. I would also like to extend a special thanks to the rest of my family: Maya, Brit, Campbell, Stewart, Aunt Diane, Aunt Dani, and Uncle Kevin.
Introduction

In today’s America, the song “When the Saints Go Marching In” is as ubiquitous as the “Pledge of Allegiance” or “Happy Birthday.” No matter which part of the country you are in, you would be hard pressed to find someone who cannot at the very least whistle the melody. It is no doubt a member of the American Songbook, the unofficial name given to America’s enduring songs. As a member of the American Songbook, “Saints,” occupies the same space of “Ol’ Susanna” and “Row, Row, Row Your Boat.” Despite this association it is an altogether unique piece of music which does not fit squarely into a single definable category. One could argue “Saints” is a spiritual, traditional, jazz standard, brass band, kid’s, gospel, Rhythm & Blues, folk, or popular song and find numerous examples to back up his/her claims. The reason it can be categorized into so many different genres is because of its varied usage throughout its history. For instance, although nowadays it is often associated with children’s music, it is rooted in African-American spiritual music. In addition to its religious affiliations, “Saints” also swings, encourages raucous behavior, condones the freedom of improvisational expression, and is linked to African-American culture.

Despite “Saints” long history, it is best known through its more modern performances and recordings. A song like “Saints” has been played in so many different styles. From the Dixieland rendition by Louis Armstrong to Dr. John’s gospel take on the piece, “Saints” has had countless interpretations over its recorded history. Despite this variety, there are a few characteristics of the song that have remained constant throughout its recorded years, regardless of its arrangement. The first is its overarching swing-feel. “Saints” incorporates a staple of jazz music, the swung eighth note (dotted eighth pulse followed by a sixteenth). This creates an upbeat feel that pushes the rhythm forward, a necessary function during brass band parades.
Another mainstay of “Saints” is its echo portion, the repetition of “oh when the saints” in the verse. Call and response is a hallmark of African-derived music practices, and this choral echo is a classic example of that musical element, as the chorus repeats both the melodic and rhythmic line of the lyric. This echo portion is what makes “Saints” so attractive to brass and Dixieland bands who employ collective improvisation, a style of soloing where the various horns play extemporaneous licks over the melody. This soli texture has been indicative of New Orleans jazz bands since the turn of the twentieth century, and still exists there to this day.

“What does [“Saints”] sound like when a New Orleans band plays it? Well, it’s the collective texture. The melody will stay, at least for the first chorus, relatively intact. And the other instruments will interject…that’s what you still hear today in New Orleans jazz and brass bands.” (Sakakeeny Interview)

This collective style is not just unique to brass bands, though, as musicians in many styles will ornament the melodic space that the echo creates between phrases. These flourishes provide the song its grand and jubilant nature, ideal for celebration.

Strangely enough, there is no consensus on the composer of the song. Although most recordings and sheet music will list it as a traditional, some have attributed specific individuals to its composition. This has caused much confusion regarding the origins of “Saints.” My goal here is to not uncover the mystery of who wrote the song, as that would be nearly impossible. The purpose of this paper rather, is to present a study of the song’s uses and adaptions as it has changed through time. A song profile is exactly this, “a selective but in-depth exploration of a song’s composition and performance history that makes apparent how variable meanings are socially constructed through time” (Magee 537). “Saints,” for instance, began as an Emancipation era African-American hymnal and today is the theme song for an NFL football team, the New Orleans Saints. The tune has gone from being appreciated and performed by a small segment of the population, to ubiquitously known amongst mainstream America. It is so
well known that many musicians find it clichéd to play, tired of its repetitive structure and associations with unimaginative tourists.

I have laid out this paper into four sections: 1) the origins of “Saints” in its recorded, oral, and anecdotal history 2) The song’s popularization by Louis Armstrong and its role in the Dixieland revival 3) “Saints” relevance in the rise of post-WWII New Orleans tourism 4) “Saints” usage in American music education. The origins chapter looks at the various sources of “Saints,” from southern camp meetings in the mid-1800s to early 1900s brass band processions. The origins chapter also analyzes some of the earliest recordings of the tune. The next chapter focuses on “Saints” following Armstrong’s iconic recording, looking at how and why it became popular in the middle of the twentieth century. The following chapter focuses on tourism and how “Saints” has factored into music’s impact on the creation of New Orleans’ tourist economy. This chapter also focuses on the transformation of New Orleans music, and how it has adapted to this changing economic emphasis. The last chapter looks at the late twentieth century development of “Saints” as a children’s tune, used to teach students marching, improvisation, and collective singing. This section tries to understand why the song fits this archetype of an education piece and how that affects its interpretation.

In these four sections I hope to make the reader aware of the various realms “Saints” occupies in American life. It has served many different functions for roughly a century and a half, showcasing the impact that songs can have on a society and how society in turn can shape the song’s interpretation itself. As Jeffrey Magee, musicologist and first scholar to use the term song profile, states, “Such studies draw their power and relevance from following a familiar, apparently simple piece through a long path of sources until the piece itself reemerges as a complex document of American music and culture” (537).
Chapter 1: The Origins of Saints

While perhaps most of us currently know “Saints” as a piece of early jazz, it occupies a much more vast musical space, encompassing many different genres. The song was likely first performed and orally transmitted as a spiritual by African-American slaves during clandestine religious ceremonies. In the late nineteenth century it was picked up by New Orleans brass bands during funeral processions. Throughout the 1920s and 30s it was recorded by many folk, gospel, and blues artists from both major and minor record labels. These are the three main areas where “Saints” existed prior to Armstrong’s 1938 recording. The main issue regarding the origins of “Saints” however, is that it has been recognized as an anonymous piece of traditional music, as well as a composed piece attributed to a specific author(s).

Saints as a Spiritual

The term “spiritual song” was created by music publishers in the nineteenth century, who needed a word to distinguish it from hymns and metrical psalms. Spiritual songs, or spirituals for short, are defined as folk-hymns originating from the American religious revival of 1740 (Kennedy 804). Spirituals are characterized by an emphasis on lyrical and melodic improvisation, as well as a call and response dynamic between the leader and chorus (Cox 312-3). The Encyclopedia of American Gospel Music specifies spirituals as a subcategory of African-American religious folk music, describing the trend in African-American music to blend the sacred and secular (Cox 312-3). “Saints” fits not only this definition of a spiritual, but is also an excellent example of the intersection between the everyday and the holy, as it has been

---

4 Although “African-American spirituals” are the preferred term today, one may also see references to negro spirituals, jubilees, slave songs, plantation songs, sorrow songs and songs of bondage in discussions of the genre. All these terms were developed post-bellum (Graham 643).
secularized throughout the years losing most of its religious meaning. In Edward Boatner’s 1927 arrangement of “Saints,” featuring the song in its most common form heard in 1920s and early 1930s sound recordings, he includes the verses “oh, when they crown him lord of all” and “when the moon rain down in blood.” The former is a reference to Jesus Christ’s second coming and the latter a reference to Judgment Day. Nowadays, at least amongst New Orleans’ brass bands, typically just the “oh when the saints go marching in” and “oh when the sun refuse to shine” verse are used. It is no longer about angels rescuing Christians from damnation but rather a celebration of personal and communal triumph. With most modern brass bands adding the “who dat gonna beat ‘dem saints” chant at the end, it has become a part of everyday life in New Orleans, a symbol of people’s connection to their city and its sports team. In many ways, African-American spirituals are the same way, giving aspects of daily life transcendent meaning.

Spirituals are of a mixed origin, the result of European colonizers in the seventeenth century evangelizing African-American slaves. Since African Americans were not permitted to practice their native religions under slavery, and therefore not allowed to sing West-African religious songs, they were forced to adopt the Christian faith and its liturgy of prayers and hymns. This conversion happened quite rapidly and, “by the end of the eighteenth century [there]…were approximately 31,000 negro church members out of an almost exact million negroes in the land” (Jackson 282). It was not long before African Americans began singing and writing Protestant spirituals of their own creation.

Much debate has occurred over who influenced whom in the creation of these spirituals. George Pullen Jackson, well-known Southern folksong scholar, claimed that blacks adopted both

---

5 Notable New Orleans’ brass bands, The Original Pinettes and Rebirth Brass Band, play the song with just the “saints go marching in” and “sun refuse to shine” verses, plus the “who dat” chant.
the cultural and musical norms of spiritual music from their white masters (Jackson 283). In his 1943 book, *White and Negro Spirituals*, Jackson points to the camp-meeting revivals, religious gatherings of southern families and their slaves, as the point of transfer of spirituals from whites to blacks.

> “Whether slave or free (as many of them were) the negro found himself among real friends—among those who, by reason of their ethnic, social and economic background, harbored a minimum of racial prejudice; among those whose religious practices came nearest what he—by nature a religious person—could understand and participate in.” (Jackson 285)

Apart from Jackson’s naivety toward the “minimum of racial prejudice,” his point about the exchange of spirituals met with considerable contention from scholars. Both Alain Locke and John Lovell, Jr. refuted Jackson’s claim, citing that camp meeting traditions did not start until the 1800s and black spirituals have been around since the late 1600s.6 The two argued that the African-American religious folk song is more solidly rooted in West African music (Cox 312-3).7

Still, the camp meetings are very important to the early history of “Saints.” In Alan Lomax’s influential 1960 study, *Folk Songs of North America*, he associates “When the Saints Go Marching In” with revival meetings in the Deep South. These meetings consisted of “backwoods whites,” who could only afford a few slaves, getting together and intermingling with other white families and their slaves (Lomax 449). At these huge events, with hundreds to thousands of people, blacks often outnumbered whites. During the meetings, both black and white participants would partake in ring shouts, where they would all improvise, clap, sing,

---

6 The first documented camp meeting occurred in Cane Ridge, Kentucky in 1801 (Graham 642)

7 Both Locke and Lovell were famous African-American educators of the mid-20th century. Locke, specifically, was a major player in the Harlem Renaissance, encouraging blacks to embrace their African cultural roots (L. Johnson)
dance, and become possessed by spiritual songs with simple, repetitive refrains (Graham 642).

Lomax includes recollections of Simon Suggs, a white Alabaman camp meeting regular, who described how the slaves would get “the jerks…plunge, pitch, convulse; as if entranced by a higher power” (Lomax 449). Through this oral transmission of religious music, many spirituals were “passed on generation to generation like a plate of warm biscuits on a cold fall morning.” (Lomax 447).

Lomax believes that African Americans used melodies from the songs they heard at these meetings to create many spirituals of their own, including “When the Saints Go Marching In” (449). He refers to “The Old Ship of Zion” and “Old Time Religion” as possible influences for “Saints,” yet compositionally they are not too similar other than their use of dominant seventh chords and leader-chorus dynamics, a trait common in nearly all spirituals (Lomax 449). In his standard reference collection, *The Book of World Famous Music*, James J. Fuld also disagrees with Lomax’s connection between the two hymns and “Saints” (642). Still, there is a good possibility “Saints” was crafted at one of these camp meetings, or at the very least influenced by one of the spirituals heard at one of these events. Unfortunately, with very sparse accounts of these meetings in existence, it is impossible to be certain that “Saints” was specifically performed there. Nevertheless these events illustrate the great oral transmission of spiritual music that occurred in the eighteenth and nineteenth centuries that allowed tunes like “Saints” to be passed down.

**New Orleans: The Jazz Funeral and The Second Line**

If the origins of “Saints” as a spiritual sung at camp meetings is a matter of historical conjecture, its appearance as part of funeral processions in New Orleans is rooted more solidly in
the recollections of various musicians and observers. These observations point to the vital role brass bands played during New Orleans jazz funerals of the late nineteenth and early twentieth centuries. Brass bands are marching ensembles of varied sizes typically consisting of 5-10 members, including: a snare, a bass drum, 2-3 trumpets/cornets, 2-3 trombones, and 1-2 tubas.8 Brass bands have been playing funerals, mostly in African-American communities, in the American South since the late 1800s, but this tradition exists almost purely in New Orleans nowadays. These funerals are held shortly after the death of a community member, and the brass band chosen is, typically affiliated with the deceased via social aid club or familial ties. These bands start the funeral with a slow tune and end with ragtime number, what we would consider swing today. “When the Saints go Marching In” is one of these 2/4 ragtime pieces played at the end of these raucous funerals which police have to contain in the streets.9

“\text{It seems certain that the roots of jazz funerals reach back to Africa, where some societies to this day use similar processions...Those roots lay dormant, or nearly so, during the long years of African-American slavery, not to gain new vigor until after the Civil War and Emancipation,}” writes Ellis Marsalis, renowned jazz educator and patriarch of the Marsalis family (Touchet and Bagneris 1). This “\text{new vigor}” Marsalis describes is indebted to the social-aid clubs and benevolent societies created in post-bellum black communities that supported former slaves with welfare programs, such as discount insurance. By just investing 25 cents over a period of time, it would ensure members a proper burial. Although these clubs existed in many American cities, private insurance companies began to make them obsolete. In New Orleans, since the benevolent

---

8 Brass Bands from the first half of the twentieth century typically had a woodwind or two, usually a clarinet or alto sax. Modern brass bands, like Rebirth and the Soul Rebels who tour and play clubs, have a tenor saxophone player as their woodwind.
9 see Bunk’s Brass Band & 1945 Sessions CD liner notes (American Music 1992)
societies engaged brass bands, they continued to thrive since the “style of music [was] so intertwined with daily life and death” (Touchet and Bagneris 2).

In his introduction to the book, *Rejoice When You Die: The New Orleans Jazz Funerals* *Die*, Marsalis states that the jazz funeral was not termed until the 1930s, yet they have existed since the mid nineteenth century (Touchet and Bagneris 2; Zander 55). Although New Orleans is the city most often associated with the tradition nowadays, brass band funerals happened all over the American south during the late nineteenth and early twentieth century. Leonard DePaur, a famous jazz composer, recalled seeing an orphanage street band play funerals in Charleston, SC, during his childhood.

“The boys who chronicled [the jazz funeral’s] development around New Orleans did a much more effective job than the people who were East, and it also seems that the whites were more aware of its value around New Orleans and they really did a job of promoting. There are evidences of this kind of activity that go back to the very time it was supposed to incubating in New Orleans. I’ve heard Hall Johnson…make the same comment…he knew of the existence of jazz very far back, and he is over seventy know. New Orleans just happened to get the publicity.” – Leonard De Paur (Feather 28-29)

Jazz historian and critic, Leonard Feather further conjectures that “rhythmic funerals were taking place, some years before the turn of the [twentieth] century, all over the South [not just New Orleans], and, indeed, wherever there was a substantial Negro population” (Feather 22).

The two main aspects of the jazz funeral are the “somber journey to [the] gravesite and [the] exuberant return from it” (Touchet and Bagneris 2). Contrary to popular belief, there is no music played during the service and interment ceremony itself; rather, the band waits outside both the funeral parlor and cemetery until the party is ready to march. The slow, somber

---

10 Musical funeral processions are in truth much older. Zander mentions an account from an Ireton funeral in 1652 where with “drum covered with cloth...they proceeded through the streets in a very solemn manner” (Puckle 201).

11 In *Roughing It*, his semi-autobiographical travel novella, Mark Twain includes a description of an 1870s “funeral pomp” with “dirge-breathing brass bands” in Virginia City, Nevada (Zander 56)
procession to the cemetery is characterized by tunes like “Amazing Grace” and “Just a Closer Walk with Thee.” In these segments, Marsalis notes, there is “virtually no improvisation” and the band plays somber marches in 4/4 time (Touchet and Bagneris 2).

“Sometimes it took them four hours to get to the cemetery. All the way they just swayed to the music and moaned. Then after the body was buried, they’d go back to town and all the way, they’d swing. They just pulled the instruments apart. They played the hottest music in the world” – Wingy Manone (Shapiro and Hentoff 16)

The improvisatory sections are saved for the jubilant march following the burial. “When a respectful distance…has been reached, the lead trumpeter sounds a two-note preparatory riff to alert his fellow musicians,” and the band starts playing upbeat, swinging tunes (Touchet and Bagneris 2). It is at this point that “Saints” is typically played. Marsalis recalls “Saints” as a “regular feature at prayer meetings and Sunday services…one day some of the churchfolk heard a jazz band playing it returning from a funeral, and it was never sung again as part of their church services” (Touchet and Bagneris 3).

This joyous parade section of the funeral procession is where second lining takes places. The second line refers to the group of non-musician participants in the procession, who dance, shout, clap, and sing as if a part of the band. The second line is an ever-expanding mass, which often gets larger than the street can handle. As Norman Leer recalls in his book of poetry Second Lining, “The police were unable to keep the second line back—all in the street, all on the sidewalks, in front of the band, and behind the lodge…We’d have some immense crowds following,” (3).

To young musicians in New Orleans, funerals were often their opportunities to play with other musicians. As Danny Barker recalls, “there were many funerals that had three or four bands…in my day, you’d get about three dollars for a parade or funeral” (Shapiro and Hentoff 16, 21). Edmond Hall punctuates this notion, “you could always make a living in New Orleans
just playing gigs like that—funerals, lawn parties, parades, et cetera” (Shapiro and Hentoff 22). Today, jazz funerals occur much more infrequently than they did in the first half of the twentieth century. Local sousaphone and trombone player Asher Ross plays in only one or two a year, despite performing with several brass bands in the city. “I’ll only get called to play if a friend I know was involved with the person who died,” says Ross (Personal Interview). Much like the declining frequency of jazz funerals, “Saints” has become increasingly rare to hear at funerals. Matt Sakakeeny, an ethnomusicologist at Tulane University, says he has never heard it before in such a setting. Possibly due to its association with tourists, it has almost become “sacrilegious” to perform in the context (Sakakeeny Interview).

Although brass band funerals are becoming more rare, second lines are as alive as ever. “In the late nineteenth century, the second line detached from the jazz funeral. Still put on by social aid and pleasure clubs, second lines wind through the neighborhoods of club members, making designated stops at their houses and other significant neighborhood sites, usually barrooms.” (Sakakeeny, “Funerals and Parades”). These parades occur every Sunday in New Orleans from September through May, some hiring multiple brass bands. These modern brass bands do not play as many standards as they once did, preferring to infuse pop and soul tunes into the medium.12 This has decreased the amount that standards like, “Didn’t He Ramble” and “Saints,” are featured in second lines and jazz funerals.

12 The Keep-N-It-Real second line parade I attended on Sunday, March 8, 2015 featuring TBC Brass Band included few standards “Saints” not being one of them. They favored pop covers like “Give Up the Funk (Tear the Roof Off the Sucker)” by Parliament and Whitney Houston’s “I Wanna Dance With Somebody.” See the Appendix for photos.
Claims to Composition

While it is most likely that “Saints” originated through oral transmission as a spiritual, and spread through the musical practices of the New Orleans jazz funeral and parades, the song has also been attributed to various composers and songwriters. James M. Black and Katherine E. Purvis are the earliest composers to be credited with penning “When the Saints Go Marching In.” Black (melody) and Purvis (lyrics) were a prominent gospel songwriting duo from Williamsport, PA best known for writing “When the Roll is Called Up Yonder” (Loyer, “Purvis” 11). In 1896, they published *Songs of the Soul No. 2* which had a spiritual in it titled, “When the Saints Are Marching In” (Loyer, “Black” 14). Mary Landon Russell’s 1957 Master’s Thesis at Lycoming College, located in Williamsport, was the first source to wrongly credit Black and Purvis with writing “When the Saints Go Marching In.” Black (melody) and Purvis (lyrics) were a prominent gospel songwriting duo from Williamsport, PA best known for writing “When the Roll is Called Up Yonder” (Loyer, “Purvis” 11). Nine years later, James L. Fuld mentioned Black and Purvis in *The Book of World-Famous Music*. “The words and music are quite similar…in particular…the famous ‘echo.’ ” (Fuld 641). One look at the sheet music, and it is clear the melody and lyrics are completely different, and as for the “famous echo” he talks of, it is simply “when the saints…are marching in.” Despite the obvious difference in the songs, this error has been perpetuated for decades. Written in 1984, Roger Lax and Richard Smith’s *The Great Song Thesaurus* attributes Black and Purvis with writing the original version of “Saints” (380). Finally, as recent as 2006, the Songwriters Hall of Fame inducted Black and Purvis for their contributions to American music, namely “When the Saints Go Marching In.” This was even after Milton Loyer, another Lycoming student, cleared up the confusion in his 2004 biography on both Black and Purvis.

13 see Appendix for sheet music
While it is easy to understand how Black and Purvis could be falsely associated with “Saints,” more puzzling is the case of Presley and Stamps. Luther Presley and Virgil Stamps were white gospel composers from Texas, who wrote songs together under the Stamps-Baxter publishing company, a major publisher of Southern Gospel music during the twentieth century (McCorkle 305). Presley was a prolific gospel songwriter who wrote more than 1,100 hymns, and now claims a spot in the Gospel Music Hall of Fame (Garrison 150). A 1998 article by Robert Sallee in the *Arkansas Democrat-Gazette* claims that the duo wrote “When the Saints Go Marching In” in 1937. Although “Saints” does not appear in any Stamps-Baxter songbooks, Sallee claims that Stamps composed the melody in Dallas, while Presley put it to lyrics in Arkansas. (Sallee). Sallee interviewed family members of Presley, who recall receiving royalties from the tune. "Sometimes he’d get maybe $1,000,” said Presley’s son, “Every time the song was played on television or a radio station, they'd send a little check” (Sallee). An entry on Presley in the *Encyclopedia of American Gospel Music* also claims that he penned the lyrics to “Saints,” citing Sallee’s article. Since the song had been recorded several times prior to 1937 it is clear that these articles are incorrect in their claim. Although the duo could have published an arrangement of the tune in 1937 and Presley and Stamps could have accidentally received royalties for this, I have not found any primary evidence to suggest such.

There is however, a songbook that includes “Saints,” and it predates 1937. Edward Boatner’s *Spirituals Triumphant: Old and New*, published in 1927, contains his arrangement of “When the Saints Go Marching In.” So far, it is the earliest printed arrangement of the song I have encountered.\(^\text{14}\) The Boatner arrangement contains the standard melody and lyrics that artists

\(^{14}\) Considering the first published collection of spirituals, *Slave Songs of the United States*, came out in 1867, “Saints” appeared quite late in the development of spirituals as a printed musical form (Graham 642)
still use to this day, with a brief solo section containing additional lyrics. Boatner himself was an
African-American songwriter, arranger, and author of over 200 books of spirituals (Tischler &
Tomasic 16). Growing up in New Orleans, he traveled around the country with his father, a
minister, picking up an ear for the various hymns of the black church. After extensive musical
education he became a music professor at the National Baptist Convention, during which time
_Spirituals Triumphant: Old and New_ was published (Tischler & Tomasic 15). Boatner never
claims to have written “When the Saints Go Marching In.” In fact, in the forward, written by a
colleague, it is stated, “having come from tradition, we lay no claim upon [the songs in this
book’s] standardization” (Boatner & Townsend 1).

The question of who wrote “When the Saint Go Marching In” is difficult to trace, partly
because the song has existed in so many different derivations and even titles. Scholars will
forever try to pin it to an earlier version: “When the Saints Go Marching Home,” “When All the
Saints Come Marching In,” and/or “When the Saints March in For Crowning.” Yet, with so
much overlap between spiritual music songs and styles, it is easy for scholars to make
relationship ties to an earlier influence. Based on the ambiguity of its origin, it is fair to say
“When the Saints Go Marching In” did not originate with one specific composer, but is more
properly considered as a traditional song.

**The Early Recordings**

By far, the most famous recording of “Saints” is Louis Armstrong’s from 1938. Despite
this popularity, many recordings predate it. Most of these pre-1938 recordings are small-time
folk singer-songwriters and gospel vocal groups, whose repertoire would have encompassed a
broad range of traditional and spiritual music. These recordings before Armstrong tell us a great
deal about the song’s usage outside New Orleans during the early decades of the 1900s. The inconsistency in lyrics between different versions shows that the song was flexible, where artists would alter verses depending on their personal style and target audience. As one can observe in many of the solo blues guitar renditions, much of the chord structure was variable as well. In addition to variations in chord structure, the early recordings of “Saints” were also recorded in a wide array of genres and styles. From “Stove Pipe No. 1,” a one-man jug band, to the vocal jubilee groups like Elkins-Payne and Paramount, “Saints” was part of many different artists’ repertoires during the 1920s.

The earliest recorded versions of the tune all appear to be performed by black groups and/or individuals. *Black Recording Artists, 1877-1927: An Annotated Discography* lists a total of eight acoustic recordings of “Saints” by African-American artists that were issued before 1927 (Gibbs 181). The earliest recording I have found by white musicians did not appear until 1928, when vocal-guitar duo, Frank & Jim McCravy recorded it on the Brunswick label (Meade et al. 593). Following 1928, gospel, folk, and blues recording artists of both races were recording the tune quite frequently. A decade later, when “Armstrong got around to recording it, ‘The Saints’ had already been thoroughly secularized and had entered the popular mainstream via recordings made for both black and white markets” (Raeburn, “Anthem” 85).

The Jubilee Recordings of the mid-1920s

Many of the earliest recordings of “Saints” were the works of jubilee vocal groups. The history of these singing groups dates back to the years following emancipation. During this time, African-American educational institutions were in dire need of funds since federal aid was insufficient. In 1871, George White, a music professor at Fisk University in Nashville, decided to
take a group of student singers on tour. In reference to the Torah’s “year of the jubilee,” the period of Hebrew freedom from Egypt, he called the group the Fisk Jubilee Singers. The term, jubilee singers, was adopted by all groups singing in the same style taught at black colleges of the era (Cox 120-122).

William C. Elkins was a major leader of jubilee groups during the 1920s, leading both the Elkins-Payne and Paramount Jubilee Singers. In 1923, The Paramount Jubilee Singers, an all-black mixed-gender vocal quartet, became the first artists to record “Saints” for a commercial record label, in this case Paramount (12073-A, digitized 78 rpm). Although the title of the song and chorus are “When All the Saints Come Marching In,” the melody is entirely the same as “When the Saints Go Marching In.” The verse lyrics however, are very different from the version Boatner would publish in 1927.15 The second verse, for example, “When Jesus Christ/I want to find/please tell me where he is/cause he alone/can ease my mind/and give my conscious peace.” Unlike the jazz version of the song we know today, this recording is very simple with a vocal quartet accompanied solely by an accordion. Since they are singing together the format of the tune is heavily structured with each of the lyrics sung carefully and with the same phrasing each time.

Just one year later, the Elkins-Payne Jubilee Singers recorded “When the Saints Go Marching In” for OKeh (Gibbs 240). The version they did is uncannily similar to the Paramount Jubilee’s, featuring the same lyrics, similar tempo, and close harmonies (OK 8170, CD via DR 5356). This is no surprise considering Elkins had a hand in both groups, and they probably used the same arrangement. These gospel recordings of “Saints” showcase its early life in the

15 Boatner’s arrangement from 1927 contains the lyrics that are most commonly sung today. Although the second and fourth verse, “O when they crown Him Lord of all” and “When the moon runs down in blood” are rarely performed the other choruses are staples for “Saints” performances. The sheet music can be viewed in the Appendix.
recorded medium as a hymn. The lyrics refer to someone finding salvation in Christ before damnation, the reason why the “saints” must intervene in the first place.

**Recordings by Bluesmen**

Another segment of the recordings from the 1920s are the solo voice and guitar versions by early blues musicians. Bo Weavil Jackson’s 1923 recording of “When the Saints Come Marching Home” is one such example (Paramount 12390-A, digitized 78 rpm). It showcases the flexibility of a solo performer when performing “Saints.” Again, the song is identical to “When the Saints Go Marching In,” except Jackson substitutes “Come” for “Go” and “Home” for “In.” As a blues guitarist, Jackson uses his freedom as a solo act to vary the lyrics to his liking during each chorus and solo section. Yet, these changes are very slight and relate just to the “oh’s” and “and’s.” In regards to form, he uses all the lines from Boatner’s arrangement save the second stanza. Perhaps, Boatner derived his arrangement of the melody and lyrics from early bluesmen like Jackson, since it is clear he was not influenced by the jubilee-style lyrics.

Barbecue Bob’s 1927 cut of “When the Saints Go Marching In” also contains much of Boatner’s arrangement from later that year, including the 8-bar solo section (Columbia 14246D, via YouTube). Bob showcases his signature percussive style, playing a single low string as a constant pedal throughout the piece, missing the majority of the chord changes. Both Bob and Jackson’s renditions show both the increasing solidification of the song’s lyrics, and its increasingly more improvisatory style in regards to melody and harmony.
Early 1930s Folk and Hillbilly Renditions

As mentioned previously, the Frank and Jim McCravy recording of “Saints” is the earliest one I have discovered by white performers. Recorded in 1927, the duo of brothers were from a well-to-do South Carolina family (Brunswick 196, via YouTube). Jim sang and played guitar and violin, while Frank sang and also carried a political career in the state’s General Assembly (McCravy 1). The version they played was entitled “When the Saints Go Marching Home,” yet it has an identical melody and form to “When the Saints Go Marching In.” The second and third verses are similar to Boatner’s solo section referring to “a loving father” and “mother.” The main difference is the beginning verse, “I heard a voice from heaven say/ come unto me and rest/ lay down thy weary one lay down/ thy head upon my breast.”

This lyric is also present in The Frank Luther Quartette’s 1934 recording for Decca, which also is called “When the Saints Go Marching Home” (5051 B, digitized 78 rpm). The quartet featured a vocal trio, slide guitar, acoustic guitar, bass, and harmonica player. They play “Saints” quite fast, similar to its modern tempo, and leave room for slide guitar and harmonica solos. Although the solos are identical each time, the recording shows that the tune is gaining an increased focus on instrumental extemporaneousness. Father of bluegrass, Bill Monroe’s 1936 recording of “Saints” illustrates this improvisatory nature beautifully (Bluebird B6820, via CD). With several solo breaks, Monroe proves that “Saints” fits the hillbilly sound perfectly.16

There is a concentration of recordings of “Saints,” specifically by white artists, in the late 1920s and early 1930s. Although a simplified conclusion, it certainly is interesting that Boatner’s *Spirituals Triumphant: Old and New* was published in 1927. Whether or not this songbook is responsible for the increase in recordings, it certainly shows the song’s increased popularity at

---

16 Although nowadays hillbilly is a derogatory term for rural dwellers, typically in Appalachia, it was the accepted term for country music at this time.
the time. Something sparked a new curiosity in this hymn, and it could have been its introduction into music publication. Boatner’s apparent spark however, is nothing compared to the next phase of “Saints” popularity. This phase is defined by the reemergence of New Orleans music during the late 1930s, culminating with the turning point of the history of “Saints”—Louis Armstrong’s 1938 Decca recording and the Dixieland Revival.
Chapter 2: Louis Armstrong, the Jazz Era, and Dixieland Revival

By the mid-1930s, Louis Armstrong had established himself as the face of American jazz music. At this point in his career he was a movie star, prominently featured in films such as *Pennies from Heaven* (1936) alongside Bing Crosby (Teachout 220). By the end of the decade, Armstrong felt compelled to explore the early days of jazz once again. This was spurred by the death of Joe “King” Oliver, legendary bandleader and the musical mentor of Armstrong’s youth in New Orleans. New Orleans music was also in fashion amongst several swing bandleaders at the time. Armstrong’s May 13th, 1938 recording of “When The Saints Go Marching In” is the result of this revitalization (Decca 63778, digitized 78 rpm).

Armstrong had “recorded almost nothing but pop tunes since he signed with Decca in 1938” (Riccardi, “Saints Revisited”). Several scholars believe this recording, on the prominent label, to be the first jazz recording of “Saints” (Giddins 112). If Armstrong was not the first, he certainly was the most notable to record the tune as a jazz piece, or otherwise, in its history. Armstrong recorded a total of four singles with Decca during that same session, including: “So Little Time (So Much To Do),” “Mexican Swing,” and “As Long As You Live You’ll Be Dead If You Die” (Willems 111-112). “Saints” stands out from the rest of these, because it is the only one that is not a standard big band swing composition. It has also proven to be by far the most popular of the three recordings, receiving roughly four times as many reissues as each of the other songs from the session. Given Armstrong’s reputation and how famous the song is, one can assume that the song instantly became a featured part of his live show, yet as Ricky Riccardi explains, this was not the case. Riccardi, a prominent Armstrong scholar and project archivist at the Louis Armstrong House Museum, accentuates the point that changes in musical repertoire happen more slowly than popular sources might represent. This is especially true for
Armstrong, who was rooted in his performance routine, playing similar sets every night and quoting his own solos quite frequently.

According to Jos Willems’ discography, the most comprehensive collection of Armstrong’s sessions, broadcast, and concerts; there is not another instance of Armstrong playing “Saints” until September of 1946 when he did a rendition for the film soundtrack to *New Orleans* (1947). Following the success of this film and subsequent promotional radio broadcasts, Armstrong started up a new band—the All Stars. This sextet, with which Armstrong toured internationally for over a decade, consisted of a more New Orleans-style line-up substituting clarinet for the more typical swing and bop-based sound of the saxophone. Early jazz experienced a renaissance called the Dixieland Revival in the late 1930s, and tunes associated with New Orleans, like “Saints” began appearing in recordings of swing music.

For Armstrong himself, “Saints” became an iconic part of his repertory, closing many of his sets until his death in 1971. It also frequently numbered among New Orleans jazz and brass band repertory during the 1940s and 1950s. Armstrong would record “Saints” a total of 58 times and perform it live on countless more occasions; present on not only his audio recordings, but also his radio shows, television broadcasts, and concert footage (Giddins 145).

Yet why 1938? Why did Armstrong not record a version of this tune earlier in his career? He learned “Saints” as a boy in the Waif’s Home Brass Band, and that the rest of his band was likely familiar with it (Teachout 35). Surely it would have worked in the Hot Fives, his 5-piece New Orleans style band active from 1925-28 and his first recorded act (Harker 4). To understand

---

17 Directed by Arthur Lubin, *New Orleans* tells a romanticized story of jazz’s origins in the city. The cast featured many popular jazz musicians like Armstrong, Billie Holiday, and Woody Herman (Riccardi, “Saints Revisited”)
why Armstrong delayed recording “Saints,” one must put it in context with the trends in jazz music of the time.

**The Dixieland Revival**

Armstrong had tried to record a rendition of “Saints” in 1931. “You’re a little ahead of your time…[T]he masses are not too much aware of the Holy Rollers,” responded an OKeh record executive to his request (Teachout 234). This remark appears to be a sarcastic poke at the lack of religious zeal in mainstream America at this time. The “masses” the executive is referring to are the popular music market, who had little interest in religious tunes. As I mentioned in the previous chapter, other artists were recording the tune in greater numbers during this time, but they were nearly all folk and blues renditions. Those recordings were meant for specific markets, gospel and African-American audiences. In addition Armstrong’s band was a big band, designed for playing swing music with intricate instrumentation and more highly composed arrangements. Armstrong was aware that the song did not fit his orchestrated swing sound of the late 1930s, and was further reminded by his label. This reminder serves as confirmation that Armstrong was no longer a local New Orleans musician, playing in dancehalls in Storyville. He was a top-selling recording artist that had to appeal to the wider American public.

What most likely changed the minds of the record companies in 1938, allowing Armstrong to record the tune, was the new trend developing in jazz music—the Dixieland revival. By the early 1930s, traditional jazz had been completely overshadowed by big band swing.18 Buddy Bolden and Bix Biederbecke were dead and King Oliver, Bunk Johnson, Jelly

---
18 Traditional jazz is defined by a collective sound in a small group, often associated with New Orleans and jazz’s earliest innovators. Swing was popular music in the 1930s and 40s, played in America’s biggest cities, in dance clubs by large ensembles with designated leaders and arrangers.
Roll Morton, and Sidney Bechet were largely forgotten. People were no longer playing old standards like “West End Blues,” or “Didn’t He Ramble.”

Swing was America’s most popular music and dance of the 1930s and 1940s, and to the revivalists, proponents of traditional jazz, it was crass commercialism. Although the claims by the supporters of early, or New Orleans jazz, were biased, they show the undercurrent of fervor for the music. The debates raged between the main jazz magazines of the day, specifically *Metronome* and *DownBeat*. Yet, the critiques were nearly all white, with African Americans just providing anecdotes for white journalists to shoot down one side of the argument. The revivalists saw traditional jazz as simpler, more raw, less influenced by Western European classical music conventions. Therefore Dixieland was more soulful, the “blacker” of the two genres (Gendron 47-48). Of course, these mostly white critics were making arbitrary claims to the “blackness” of the genres and had very little empirical evidence to support their claims. In the eyes of the artists of the revival itself, the opportunity to play traditional jazz tunes presented an exciting new adventure in big band arranging.

Benny Goodman was one bandleader up for the challenge. In 1935 he had a surprise hit with Fletcher Henderson’s big band arrangement of Jelly Roll Morton’s “King Porter Stomp.” This spurred a series of actions by once relevant and now outdated artists, bringing them back into the limelight after years of obscurity. In 1935, The Original Dixieland Jazz Band got back together and played a concert for the first time in a decade. Jelly Roll Morton also came out of the woodwork, recording an autobiographical series for the Library of Congress. It all came to a climax though, on January 16, 1938, when Goodman’s Orchestra played a concert at Carnegie Hall featuring interpretations of both Armstrong and Biederbecke’s music and performing personas. In addition, John Hammond produced a pair of shows called “From Spirituals to
Swing” featuring Count Basie, Benny Goodman, James P. Johnson, and many others, showcasing the trajectory of jazz music across the early twentieth century and its intersection with hymnals. These events truly marked the beginning of this renewal of New Orleans and early jazz music and the increasing interest in the history of jazz that would later be labeled the Dixieland Revival.

Armstrong’s first recording of “When the Saints Go Marching In” was born out of this renaissance, as it had never before been recorded in the jazz idiom prior. Had Goodman and other big bandleaders not begun including older hits and songs in their repertoire, the interest in early jazz may not have emerged. One can see why the record company would now want Armstrong to record older tunes in this new climate, when he had been previously doing almost exclusively swing (Riccardi, “70 Years”). One year later, in 1939, Armstrong did even more big band big band reworkings of early jazz tunes, including “Hear Me Talkin’ To Ya” and “West End Blues”

**The 1938 Decca Recording**

Of the 58 recordings Armstrong made of “Saints,” the one he recorded on May 13th, 1938 remains his most recognizable rendition. Arranged by his pianist Luis Russell, it was the fourth and final tune of the day’s session in New York City (Willems 111-112). Although the sixteen-measure introduction is highly reminiscent of the beginning of many swing-era tunes by bandleaders like Count Basie or Duke Ellington, Paul Barbarin’s parade-style drumming approach brings out the recording’s New Orleans influence. Barbarin’s use of the snare, his syncopated bass drum kicks, and tom-tom accents between choruses are “a hallmark of New
Orleans drumming” (Riccardi, “Saints Revisited”). Another notable marker of this New Orleans style is the collective improvisation on the track. Although it is arranged and not improvised, Russell intentionally tried to emulate this sound with the horn backgrounds over the solo and intro sections. It is an unusual hybrid of big band and Dixieland which seamlessly fits together without leaning too much towards one side of the spectrum.

For the recording’s lyrics, Armstrong simply uses the first verse of the song, and repeats it twice. The choral echo, completed by an uncredited vocal chorus with a prominent female voice, provides a smoother harmony than the earlier Paramount and Elkins-Jubilee versions. They repeat truncated versions of the lyrics Armstrong sings, providing a lyrical hook typical of swing music. What makes this recording so unique is mainly its instrumentation. None of the other recordings of “Saints” to this point have featured a prominent horn section, nor have they swung quite like this with a thumping 2/4 drum feel. However, what makes the piece so idiosyncratic amongst Armstrong’s repertoire is not the arrangement itself, but the sermon beforehand, featuring Armstrong’s favorite on-stage character—Reverend Satchelmouth.

**Reverend Satchelmouth**

> “Sister and Brothers! This is Reverend Satchmo gettin’ ready to beat out this mellow sermon for you. My text this evening is ‘When the Saints Go Marching In.’ Here come Brother Higginbotham down the aisle with his tram-bone. Blow it, boy!” – Louis Armstrong, introduction to the 1938 recording

In a clear homage to his past, Armstrong channels a preacher in New Orleans in this opening sermon to the recording. While we cannot be certain about its origins, Armstrong likely

---

19 Paul Barabarin is a member of a famous brass band family. He eventually went on to lead the Onward Brass Band (*The Last Journey*).

20 Although in later recordings Armstrong will add “when the saints go marching by” to the second verse, he never used the lyrics in their entirety.
developed the character as a young boy, parodying his preacher at church. Scholars date his preacher imitations to the mid-20s, where “he’d shout, he’d jump, he’d deliver mock sermons,” according to Laurence Bergeen (Stein 192). The Reverend Satchelmouth character first appeared in 1931, on his recording of “The Lonesome Road” (Stein 193-4). This persona was that of a stylized New Orleans black church minstrel with excessive greed and lust, half inspired by his childhood and half by vaudeville entertainers Bert Williams and Bill “Bojangles” Robinson (Stein 192). It became a well-established part of his live routines by the mid-1920s, a staple of his performances in Chicago and New York. Reverend Satchelmouth represented a light-hearted and humorous social commentary that brought out good and bad elements of his New Orleans childhood.

Armstrong begins his “Satchmo” sermon with a nod to “Brother Higginbotham,” a reference to Armstrong’s lead trombonist, J.C. Hickenbottom. Armstrong is acting like a preacher in church trying to inspire the congregation, or in this case his band, to be moved by the gospel, or in this case the music. Armstrong does this again later in the tune for Charlie Holmes, prefacing his alto saxophone solo with “Blow it, Brother Holmes.” What makes these church analogies ironic is that, in many ways, Armstrong represents the end of “Saints” as a religious song. The popularity that the song attained after his recording solidified its secularization. By dropping all but the first verse, Armstrong had brought the hymn into the realm of popular music. This is not say that the song has no meaning to Armstrong. On the contrary, it had a breadth of influence in his life, but not in a religious domain; rather it allowed him to connect with the city of his birth, a place where he felt out of place in later in life because of segregation and institutionalized racism. The Reverend Satchelmouth character blurs the lines between
spirituality and tradition much like “Saints” itself. Although the song has clear religious details, it is at heart a song of pride and joy for one’s community and background.

**Immediate Impact of 1938 Recording**

The transition of “When the Saints Go Marching In” from a spiritual to a jazz tune was a long one. As Lomax puts in *Folks Songs of North America*, “Through an irony of history, [Saints] has become an international hot jazz standard” (449). Armstrong played a pivotal role in changing the association of the tune from spiritual music to jazz. For the first half of the twentieth century, these musical realms existed completely separate. In New Orleans especially, it was seen as sacrilegious to play hymns in a jazz band. In 1927, The Sam Morgan Jazz Band became the first jazz group to record hymns, at the suggestion of Columbia Records (Joyce et al. xvi-xvii). Columbia’s A&R representative knew that spirituals and gospel records were selling well at the time, and thought Morgan’s band could cash in on the fad. Armstrong’s sister Beatrice (known as Mama Lucy) gives one an idea of how unusual it was to record hymns in a jazz setting during the 1930s.

She was not happy about her brother’s recording of “Saints” and accused him of “tarting up a piece from the church.” When Armstrong heard this, he got angry but quickly remarked on his sister’s affinity for “playing bingo in the church.” (Giddins 112). Nowadays, people do not think twice when hearing “Saints” in a jazz club, but for a while it was taboo. Isaiah Morgan, of the Sam Morgan Jazz Band, specifies that “[his band] played [spirituals] on parades. But [they] didn’t play no spirituals nor hymns in no dance halls” (*Music Rising* 1958). It was only after the success of Armstrong’s recording of “Saints,” that jazz bands in New Orleans began playing it in dance halls. In his 1961 interview with Bill Russell, Andrew Morgan, brother of Isaiah and
saxophone player in Sam Morgan’s Jazz Band, describes the tendency of bands to play “Saints” in the style of Armstrong following the 1938 recording (Music Rising).

Recorded acts also tried to emulate the success of Armstrong’s arrangement by doing their best to recreate the sound of the Decca record. The Wingy Manone Orchestra recording of “Saints” from September 6, 1938 is a near carbon copy to Armstrong’s. With an eerily similar 16-bar opening, featuring Manone giving a mock sermon, the all-white big band appears to be doing all they can to capture the sentiment of Armstrong’s rendition. “Say bud. Look at all them Saints come marching in. Boy, you better put away that gin. Stand up there with that trombone, and blow away all your sins,” preaches Manone over the instrumental introduction, prefacing the trombone solo. The time feel and choral echoes are nearly identical to the Armstrong version. To top it all off the same exact instruments take solos in the same exact order on both recordings (first trombone, then alto sax, then trumpet).

In addition to Manone, Bunk Johnson also recorded “Saints” in the first few years following Armstrong’s Decca recording (American Music V-252, digitized 78 rpm). Johnson himself was an influential brass bandleader from New Orleans and the first of which to be recorded. This recording occurred in 1944 under the direction of American Music recording engineer, Bill Russell. Russell wanted spirituals for the record, and had Johnson’s Brass Band run through back-to-back takes of “Saints” putting one on the record (Hazeldine 28). Although the band did not expect the song to get too much attention, audiences on the road loved it and expected to hear it almost every night.

“When the American Music record came out [Bunk’s band] got a lot of requests for [“Saints”] when the band appeared in New York. When the customers applauded, they’d play the last chorus over again. If the applause continued, they would repeat the whole number over again sometimes as many as four times. Bunk didn’t enjoy doing it over and over again, but as long as the public liked it he would play it. The other New York bands picked up on it and very soon bands all over the country started playing it.” – Bill Russell (Hazeldine 28)
Although Russell is likely exaggerating the widespread influence Johnson’s band played in the dissemination of the tune nationwide, he still illustrates its development as an American fan favorite. Just one year later, when Russell recorded Bunk’s Brass Band for their second record, the band picked “Saints” as their sound check. It was never supposed to make the final release, but due to its popularity in their set, the band and label agreed that it would be smart to put “Saints” on the record’s final printing (Hazeldine 76). Although these recordings seem to suggest that “Saints” was gaining considerable popularity during the 1940s, it takes roughly ten years before it becomes a staple in Armstrong’s sets.

The All Stars and Saints Internationally

The 1947 film, *New Orleans*, in which Armstrong appeared, had an immense impact on the role of “Saints” in Armstrong’s band, and the make-up of the band itself. Armstrong recorded three short, instrumental takes of the song alongside early jazz legends Kid Ory and Barney Bigard for the film (Riccardi, “Saints Revisited”). As part of the promotion for the movie, Armstrong also recorded “Saints” for WOR radio’s “This Is Jazz” broadcast on April 26, 1947 in New York City (Willems 165). One month after this broadcast, Armstrong performed “Saints” once more with a small ensemble at New York City’s Town Hall (Riccardi, *Wonderful World* 3). These motions towards a smaller group caused Armstrong to form his next main act—The All Stars. The All Stars formed in 1947, debuting at Billy Berg’s nightclub in Los Angeles on August 13 of that year (Riccardi, *Wonderful World* 17). Barney Bigard (clarinet), Big Sid Catlett (drums), and Jack Teagarden (trombone) were some of the early mainstays of the band, however the group’s players were constantly in flux, with additions and substitutes occurring quite frequently during its 24-year span. (Riccardi, *Wonderful World* 20).
“Saints” found its real home with Armstrong’s All Stars, who were one of the few multiracial bands touring at the time. Yet, even after the success of *New Orleans*, “Saints” was not an immediate staple in the band’s repertoire. It took a pairing with another 1938 Decca recording to make it a hit amongst All Star fans. In September of 1948, Armstrong arranged the tune as the second part of a medley with “Shadrack” (Riccardi, “Saints Revisited”). “Shadrack” retells the biblical story of Shadrach, Meshach, and Abednego; three Jews who were burned by the Babylonian king for refusing to bow to a golden idol. In the end, angels come from the heavens rescuing the three victims. Although Armstrong infused some jazz imagery, mentioning “the music of the trombone…clarinet,” the lyrics stay close to the gospel. First performed on a Philadelphia TV broadcast The slow, dragging tempo of “Shadrack,” ends with an upbeat drum break leading into a much faster version of “Saints” than on the 1938 recording, at 250 bpm compared to 190 (Willems 184). The religious connotations of both songs made the pairing appropriate however, and the contrast of fast and slow tempos could have been an incidental reference to the dirge-jubilee progression of the jazz funeral.

After playing the medley on and off between 1948 and the first half of 1953, Armstrong decided to use it as a closer for his shows on tour with Benny Goodman in the summer of 1953 (Riccardi, “Saints Revisited”). Fans loved the song, and by the end of the year, the “Shadrack/Saints” medley had become a staple at the end of their sets. Sometimes they would get three or four encores, each time playing “Saints” a little faster and sometimes an octave higher, to showcase Armstrong’s astonishing range (Riccardi, “Saints Revisited”)

Armstrong had a tendency to stay true to his sound, part of the reason the “Shadrack/Saints” medley received so much play. While former swing musicians like Dizzy Gillespie and Charlie Parker were breaking ground with bebop in the 1940s, Armstrong wanted
nothing to do with this brand of jazz for the musician rather than the consumer. Rather, as he
stated in various interviews at the time, he was more interested in pleasing his audience.

“The public can get to know you better by them old tunes than by anything new. So, like
Keifetz and Marian Anderson, we play the same tunes; every time they play the same
solo they get the applause—so do we” – Armstrong in the early 1950s (Teachout 277)

With the All Stars Armstrong found that the audience for “Saints” and New Orleans music was
an increasingly global one. Famously, they ended their 1964 world tour in Australia with a
performance of “Saints” where they paraded around stage harking back to the second line (Stein
253). This shows Armstrong in his role as the “jazz ambassador,” a moniker given to him in his
later years as he began to tour on an increasingly international stage. Armstrong would use
“Saints” as an example to showcase New Orleans jazz music and black culture to the rest of the
world. In the movie, Satchmo the Great (1957), a theatrical representation of the All Stars’ 1955
European tour, Armstrong steps off a plane in Switzerland playing “Saints” with a local band
(Nollen 135-137). The tune was an introduction of sorts, helping to bridge a cultural gap. This
hegemony shows the power of “Saints” as a cross-cultural tool. It is simple enough that
musicians all over the world can pick up on it, yet distinctly American. It presents an expedient
way for American jazz musicians to explain the tradition on foreign soil, despite the ambiguous
role “Saints” actually played in the origins of jazz music itself.

“Just A Boy From New Orleans:” Louis Armstrong’s Final Years

By the late 1960s, the decades of traveling and playing on the road both nationally and
internationally had taken their toll on Armstrong. He spent the majority of his free time resting,
recovering from his numerous health issues including phlebitis (inflamed veins). By 1970, his
leg problems, specifically, got so bad that he had to be carried on and off stage (Riccardi,
Wonderful World 292). In these last years of his life, Armstrong became more reflective on his career and began outwardly expressing his appreciation to his friends, fans, and family, on stage.

This sense of introspection culminated in his May 29, 1970, Flying Dutchman recording session (Willems 397-8). It was on this record, entitled Louis Armstrong and his Friends, that Armstrong debuted “Boy From New Orleans,” his autobiographical take on “When the Saints Go Marching In” which chronicles his life from his youth in New Orleans to his time as “jazz ambassador” (Riccardi, Wonderful World 293). The tune itself is melodically and structurally identical to “Saints” in its original form, just set to different lyrics. Conducted and arranged by the famous jazz saxophonist and bandleader, Oliver Nelson, the line up for the recording session was packed with iconic jazz musicians: Thad Jones, Chuck Rainey, and Kenny Burrell (Willems 397).

The arrangement itself is reminiscent of soul jazz, a genre of jazz that had emerged in the 1950s that incorporated elements of rock n’ roll and gospel. The bassline grooves much like an R&B track of the time, and the piano accompaniment is heavily rooted in blues and boogie-woogie patterns. The drums swing hard, which give the song a nostalgic feel. Still, it is a departure from the collective textures of brass bands that Luis Russell tried to emulate in his 1938 arrangement.

What really makes this song interesting, since it is a melodic copy of “Saints;” is its lyrics, which provide a transparent, albeit generalized, look at Armstrong’s life trajectory. Below are the lyrics to “Boy From New Orleans” in their entirety as they appeared on the 1970 LP record (Bluebird 8310-1, via YouTube).

Oh I was born, long long ago.
July the fourth, 19-0-0.
Back a town, down in Jane’s Alley.
Just a boy from New Orleans.
When I was on-ly, 5 or so.
Down Rampart Street, I used to go.
And I heard the great Bunk Johnson.
Jazz it up in New Orleans.

Right then I knew, that I was born.
Blow that jazz on this ol’ horn.
And I’d make ‘em proud of Louis,
Way down in New Orleans.

And as time went by, I’d join a band.
Spread the sound all around the land.
Went from Beale Street to St. Louis,
Playing jazz from New Orleans.

We blew like mad, back in those days
(We sho’ did)
Speakeasy joints and cabaraets
And there were no prohibitions, on the jazz from New Orleans.

Now in Hollywood, I took my place,
With my friend Bing and Princess Grace
This old Satch was really swinging
A star from New Orleans

And then Europe called, and off I went.
And blew across the continent.
I was called the jazz ambassador.
Bringing jazz from New Orleans.

All through the years, I’ve had a ball.
Oh thank you Lord, And I thank you all.
You’ve been mighty good to old Satchmo…yes
This old boy from New Orleans

Much like “Saints,” the lyrics of “Boy From New Orleans” were malleable, as Armstrong would change various words in the melody depending on his audience. During a January 29, 1971 concert at the U.S. Press Club in Washington D.C., with many from Louisiana in attendance, Armstrong made small adjustments to his lyrics to please his hometown audience (CITATION). These changes included a substitution of “King Oliver” for “Bunk Johnson” and the addition of “honky tonks” to his list of early gig venues. The very last stanza of the tune was always done at a slow, dirge-like tempo, embellishing the sentimentality in the words. This sentimentality was even more moving because of Armstrong’s deteriorating health. In fact, “Boy From New
“Orleans” would be the last song he ever played on stage, during the Waldorf-Astoria gigs from 1971 (Riccardi, *Wonderful World* 293).

“He had tears in his eyes as he walked off stage during his last night at the Waldorf…In all my years with him, I have never seen him cry before. He played his horn like he never played before.” – road manager Ira Mangel (Riccardi, *Wonderful World* 294)

Louis Armstrong died in his sleep of “kidney failure, attributable to heart failure” on July 6th, 1971 (Riccardi, *Wonderful World* 300). At his funeral, Dizzy Gillespie argued that, “Louis is not dead, for his music is and will remain in the hearts and minds of countless millions of the world’s people, and in the playing of hundreds of thousands of musicians who have come under his influence” (Riccardi, *Wonderful World* 301). “Saints” is no doubt one of these songs which Gillespie is referring to, as it has lived on to this day in large part due to Louis Armstrong’s contributions. Without his unrelenting loyalty towards the song, playing it in some form or another at nearly all of his post-1953 concerts, it likely would not have been imprinted on the ears of mainstream America.
Chapter 3: Saints and the Growth of New Orleans Tourism

“I’m worried about this one,” said the airport bus driver regarding my stay in New Orleans. This was my first verbal interaction in the city, and it was with a worker in the tourist industry assuming I would not want to return home. My four-day trip in the city over spring break 2015 included many encounters like this, where locals and outsiders encouraged me to engage in common tourist activities. “What are you doing around here,” said a maintenance worker at Louis Armstrong Park, “you gotta check out Bourbon Street and get not one, but two hand grenades, one for each hand.” Everywhere I turned people were pointing me away from public spaces, like the park, and encouraging me to head for the French Quarter.21

Saints as “Tourist Bait”

“When the Saints Go Marching In” factors deeply in the history of New Orleans tourism. Today the song is emblematic of the city, many brass and traditional or “trad” jazz bands will play “Saints” at every show, usually ending a set with it (Ross Interview). It is typically played upon request, and not by the choice of the musicians. It is played so often in the French Quarter, that Preservation Hall has an infamous sign listing “traditional” requests at $2, “others” at $5, and “The Saints” at $10.22 Interestingly this pricing reflects more than just the tune’s stifling familiarity, and delves into the realm of superstition. In 1965, Papa John Joseph, the Preservation Hall Band’s bass player, suddenly collapsed after a rousing rendition of “Saints,” saying “That about took everything out of me” just before dying (Raeburn, “Anthem” 85). Bruce Raeburn,

21 Hand grenades are yard-long frozen cocktail drinks exclusively available in the French Quarter, served in plastic cups shaped like grenades which people are free to carry in the street.
22 see Appendix for a photo of a replica of this sign printed on a souvenir magnet.
curator of the Hogan Jazz Archives at Tulane University, is surprised Preservation Hall does not charge more for “Saints” considering the “gris gris factor.”²³

Much to my surprise, during my four-day trip to New Orleans, I did not once hear “Saints.” I heard several jazz groups in clubs, attended a brass band at a second line, experienced plenty of street music, and heard radio broadcasts and recorded music, but did not once hear the tune which is the subject of this paper. The song, which I assumed had roots in the city so deep that it would be blasting through potholes on the street, is ”tourist bait” as Matt Sakakeeny puts. Sakakeeny completed his dissertation and recently a book on the ethnography of New Orleans brass bands. “There is no authentic, grassroots life for that song,” he told me “It’s not like people sit around backstage and do interpretations of that song.” Sakakeeny also made the point that Rebirth Brass Band, one of New Orleans’ most prominent brass bands and the main subject of his research, will only play “Saints” at gigs where the audience is comprised mainly of tourists, like at Convention Center shows and birthday parties.

What puzzled me is why native musicians would use this tune, which seems to have such a strong association with the tourist industry, as a way to present New Orleans culture to outsiders. Would musicians not want something more representative of what they are actually playing? I saw Rebirth play at The Maple Leaf Bar during my trip, where they are a Tuesday night institution, and they did not play a single traditional song, preferring hip-hop covers like “Casanova” and 60s R&B tunes like “It’s All Over Now.” Why would they not display these tunes as the “real” New Orleans? Sakakeeny explains, “[they do it] because [Saints is] expedient, it’s a resource, it’s a musical symbol that everyone will recognize.”

²³ A reference to New Orleans tendency towards superstition. Gris gris is a West African amulet originally used to protect its wearer from ill fortune, yet is associated with black magic and bad voodoo in today’s Louisiana’s Creole communities.
Sakakeeny compared it to Robert Johnson’s “Sweet Home Chicago” for Chicago blues musicians. In this case, it is a song detested by most local musicians but played nightly at most blues clubs in the city because of its tourist appeal. “And when performers introduce ‘Sweet Home Chicago,’ the city’s easiest crowd-pleaser, it is never hard to predict that they will soon have their audiences enthusiastically smiling and singing in unison on the familiar refrain” (Grazian 6). It is a song musicians are “bored with” having “played it so many times” it has become a staple in what one blues player calls the “setlist from hell.” (Grazian 140, 149). Even critics have concurred with this assessment of the tune, with Bill Dahl of the Chicago Tribune calling “Sweet Home Chicago” a “shopworn staple of the new blues experience” (Grazian 8).

While the life of Robert Johnson’s tune has only recently attained this dreaded existence, it seems “Saints” has been detested by New Orleans musicians for quite some time. Isaiah Morgan, a member of Sam Morgan’s Jazz Band, noted this in a 1958 interview with Bill Russell. “Well they’ve taken [Saints] for a real racket. Well [brass bands] do that. But we never do that. They copied that from Louis’ playing it on the record. And they just started playing it in the dance hall, because people would ask ‘em see. Any place they ask me for that, I’d tell ‘em I wouldn’t play that” (I. Morgan, Music Rising). This trend continues to this day. Local brass band musician Asher Ross says that some of the musicians he often plays with utterly hate it. In this regard though, it is in good company, as Ross admits to loathing Herbie Hancock’s “Chameleon” even more, which he ends up playing every gig and has fewer chords than the three-chord “Saints.”
Saints in a City of Sinners

New Orleans has always served as a bastion for raucous and ludic behavior. It is a place where people go to partake in socially acceptable sin, partying along to upbeat music often from an older era. This allows them to engage in their idea of a simpler, more carefree time, where having a devil-may-care attitude is a necessity. Most people know the words and/or melody to “Saints,” and therefore love to hear it. Ironically though the tune preaches the gospel, these people are in New Orleans singing along as they take a break from societal norms and moral expectations.

The Crescent City has been associated with debauchery for quite some time. When Storyville, the city’s now-extinct red light district, opened in 1897, it was home to scores of pleasure clubs and whorehouses. Bourbon Street, the crown jewel of the city’s French Quarter, and its tourist mecca, was once teeming with prostitutes, delinquents, criminals, and social outcasts of all sorts. All this was indebted to its status as a port city, home to seafaring trade and travel. This scene naturally supported jazz music and its players who found plenty of work on the street and in burlesque clubs. When Storyville was closed in 1917, many of these musicians were forced to go elsewhere for work. It took decades for New Orleans to attract musicians and tourists back to the city, an outcome that was not achieved until the 1950s.

It is no secret that New Orleans is a very unique American city. With a majority African-American population of 60% and distinct cultural appeal, it is completely different from other cities in the American South (Atkinson 93). With French Creole culture as well, New Orleans’ characteristic ethnic and racial qualities make it a very profitable city for tourists, who come seeking an exotic place in the continental United States. Unfortunately, due to this profitability, the city has been often deliberately exploiting its native, predominantly African-American,
inhabitants for the process of increasing revenue. This commodification of culture has evolved in stages starting in the nineteenth century. As early as 1802, visitors noted the distinct jubilant, bright atmosphere of the city.

“New Orleanians manage during a single winter to execute about as much dancing, music, laughing, and dissipation as would serve any reasonably disposed, staid, and sober citizen for three or four years” (Kmen 6)

After the city officially closed Storyville in 1917, it turned a blind eye to the neighborhood in the following years, as tourists, especially sailors, would dress in civilian clothes and continue to solicit prostitutes. Although the days of overt prostitution have since passed, the city’s unofficial policy of “unobtrusive non-observance” towards its salacious decadence still exists (Long 39). To this day, New Orleans prides itself in being a playground for Americans to commit acts of debauchery without repercussion. In other words, it is an oasis of promiscuity in the conservative desert of the Bible Belt; a less manufactured Las Vegas.

What really occupied the city’s tourist department was finding ways of preserving this raunchiness while cleaning it up enough to make it desirable to a mainstream (i.e. white middle-class) market. Starting with Mayor deLesseps S. Morrison in the 1950s, the municipal government began gentrifying the French Quarter, Vieux Carré, to rid it of “undesirables.” By the 1960s, the city had flushed out as much of this “filth” as possible, relocating the homeless people and strip clubs. The city was careful to execute this “cleaning” without losing the gritty charm they were trying to market, as they refused to ban the selling and consumption of alcohol in public (Souther 121).
The Commodification of Jazz

Music factored heavily into the gentrification of the city as a medium perfectly suited to this “clean raunchiness.” The public displays of brass band and Dixieland music allowed the tourist to experience this sense of adventure without engaging in immoral or illegal activity. Yet, the New Orleans we know today, which bursts at the seams with musical performance, was a mere shadow of its current status. During World War II, with the advent of jukeboxes and radios, “jazz practically disappeared from the area of New Orleans most frequented by tourists” (Souther 119). As jazz scholar Orin Blackstone observed in 1940, it “might well be true that on an ordinary weekend New Orleans would offer no more music than any other city its size” (Souther 119).

The 25-year process of New Orleans’ transformation into a “jazz city” started in 1948 with the founding of the New Orleans Jazz Club, NOJ (Souther 119). The NOJ held traditional jazz concerts and assisted music aficionado tourists in finding jazz venues. It is amazing to think that the city known as the “birthplace of jazz” was not always its epicenter, but between 1920 and 1960 jazz flourished outside the Crescent City in places like New York, Chicago, and Kansas City where many New Orleans natives were innovating and perfecting the art form. What inhibited the city from supporting a strong jazz scene was both its nostalgia for older styles, out of favor nationally, and institutionalized racism. Jim Crow prevented blacks and whites from playing in shows with one another, staying at the same hotels, eating at the same restaurants, and marching side-by-side in the same parade. Even after Brown vs. the Board of Education, a Louisiana law bypassed the Supreme Court’s ruling, forbidding blacks and whites from performing together on stage (Souther 126). Louis Armstrong refused to play in the city, because they would not allow the multiracial All Stars to play most venues.
The two main entities responsible for the re-emergence of New Orleans as the “jazz city” were Southland Records and Preservation Hall. Joe Mares opened Southland Recording Studio in 1953, where he recorded Pete Fountain and Al Hirt, two of the most prominent acts in the Dixieland Revival. Apart from recording albums with traditional jazz artists, Mares also brought them on tour to the West Coast, where they caught the ear of those audiences. This outreach helped interest more American tourists in traveling to New Orleans to experience the music in its authentic environment. Preservation Hall was founded shortly thereafter in 1961. The non-profit institution was meant to give the appearance of an old time jazz club, and it has been so successful that to this day many erroneously think that the club has been operating since jazz’s beginning (Souther 124-5) The Hall helped employ local musicians, especially those of color. The owners found that tourists expected a stereotypical “older black man, white shirt open at the collar, suspenders, simply cut trousers, plain black shoes, and legs crossed” to be on stage playing traditional songs (Souther 124-5). So, in part for business reasons, Preservation Hall helped support African-American musicians in the city, during a time of appalling segregation.

The name itself, Preservation Hall, connotes a self-conscious notion to protect cultural treasures. Although to the Hall, this means preserving and supporting local acts, to the New Orleans tourism board, it meant a huge profit margin. When the city realized the goldmine it sat on with Creole culture and early jazz music it sought to create a “canned history;” real enough to market to outsiders, but fake enough to provide comfort to a largely white middle-class demographic (Souther 114).24

With the passing of the Civil Rights Act in 1964, New Orleans was finally free to milk its culture without segregation getting in the way, much to the chagrin of most area politicians. During the 1970s, a massive gentrification plan took place in the city’s French Quarter.

24 see Appendix for a picture of Preservation Hall from my spring break trip
Modeling itself after a section of Disneyland, the Vieux Carre became an artificial paradise with manufactured exoticism. However, rather than spreading the infrastructure into the city, they created this tourist trap along the waterfront, isolated from the local populations.

One of the first steps in this gentrification process was the creation of Jackson Square, an open mall for pedestrian street spending. Three blocks of buildings were cleared to craft the perfect setting for street performers, vendors, and fortune tellers to turn profits (Souther 130). A neighborhood that once bustled with local commerce, now just served tourists with poor imaginations (Souther 133). The French Market followed Jackson Square, as it was remodeled into a tourist trap in 1975 after the aesthetics of Faneuil Hall in Boston. A historic trading post was buried to make way for gimmicky stores and souvenir shops.

Inherent in this gentrification was the marginalization of African Americans. As the city began catering to suburban whites and out-of-town tourists, it simultaneously isolated its native black population. Arguably the worst example of this came in 1972, with the building of Louis Armstrong Park. After Armstrong’s death, the city wanted to pay reparations to the black community by building a cultural center at Congo Square, a historic site of racial integration. The goal of the park was to craft a place of historic preservation at a historically significant location. In a horrible case of irony, it did just the opposite as a fledgling area of African-American businesses and homes were destroyed to make way for this tourist playground. It was a site for privileged tourists to take in New Orleans “packaged culture” when the “real” Treme was across the street (Souther 134-135).

Another example of this marginalization occurred in 1966, with the construction of the I-10 overpass. Built with money raised from the post-World War II tourist boom, it was originally planned to go through a neighborhood of the French Quarter. However, after a historic

---

25 see Appendix for photograph of the gateway to the park
preservation group fought this off, it was relocated through the heart of Tremé, New Orleans’ historically black neighborhood adjacent to the French Quarter (Sakakeeny, “Under the Bridge” 5-6). The overpass represents the modern trend in American urban planning that enables tourists easy access to their gentrified downtown destinations, while driving over the heart of a dilapidated neighborhood. In other words, it is a way for both locals and visitors not to dirty themselves with the social issues plaguing the city.

The Modern Importance of the Second Line

In an effort to thwart the dominance personified by the overpass, Tremé’s social aid clubs and brass bands have been gathering “under the bridge” for decades, climaxing their processions at that spot. The use of second lining as peaceful protest to racial oppression goes back to the days of Emancipation. As pioneering clarinetist and saxophonist, Sidney Bechet put it, this form of music-making was African Americans’ way of “find[ing] out in the music what they were supposed to do with this freedom” (50). The now-free, black community of New Orleans wasted no time with subtlety, and celebrated their culture in the most exuberant way possible, parading and singing. Fast-forward to the twenty-first century, and second lining has become a “symbolic act of resistance to Jim Crow,” where official laws and codes can be broken with enough crowds, volume, and celebrating (Brothers 22).

Second lining has caused a complete reversion in the symbolism of the I-10 overpass, which has now become a commemorative spot. It showcases the triumph, passion, and resilience of New Orleans’ African-American culture, rather than their marginalization. Funeral processions and Carnival season parades use the bridge as a point of arrival, meant to show off the African-American community as an integral part of the city, responsible for New Orleans’
image and consequently its riches. I was able to attend one of these second lines and distinctly recall a parade member screaming “take it to the bridge” as we marched down St. Bernard Street towards the Claibourne Ave. overpass. This particular second line was “about 90% local,” claimed one observer. Whether this number is exact or not, the point is that the second line allows people from all walks of life to celebrate and give attention to an often overlooked part of the city. Nowadays, rare, curious tourists are beginning to venture away from the commercial districts of the city and actually partake in the second lines that occur in this area.

What makes the overpass so interesting is that it amplifies the soundscape of the city. The low overheads create an intimate setting where musicians blowing at full volume can produce a wall of sound loud enough to trump the output of rushing cars (Sakaeeny, “Under the Bridge” 3). If you view the accompanying video footage I took of the Keep-N-It-Real second line, you can see how people all converge at this spot, and the music really picks up; it is the ceremonial midway point of the parade, and the most crowded I remember it getting. The low-fi landscape of the overpass, and other parts of the city give New Orleans music its signature brilliance and zeal. As Danny Barker puts, its “The ice-cream man, the crab man, each with a song or some noise to identify them…people walking along singing popular jazz songs, sad mournful spirituals” (Sakakeeny, “Under the Bridge” 3).

Unfortunately, because “Saints” is such an unpopular song amongst musicians, it has come to indirectly represent this commodification of African-American New Orleans music and culture. Brass bands tend not play it during their weekly second lines. In fact, traditional songs in general are uncommon during modern second lines, which have become increasingly interested in appealing to younger audience members. Although this is good, because it connects younger generations to the brass band tradition, it means older staples like “Saints” have fallen out of the

26 see Appendix for the map of the parade route
repertoire. Art Perry, New Orleans radio DJ, cannot remember the last time he played it on-are save for 2010, when the New Orleans Saints won the Super Bowl. Some brass band musicians do not seem to mind this change in style however. To Be Continued Brass Band (TBC) trumpeter Sean Roberts remarks, “Sometimes we’ll play, like a hip-hop song…some older guy, they will belike ‘That’s not traditional New Orleans music.’ And sometimes we go. ‘Kiss our ass, we know it’s not. We know that” (Raeburn, “Faith” 146). These changes have been decades in the making, however, going back to the innovations by several brass bands. Brass bands like Eureka and Young Tuxedo bridged the gap between tradition and modernity. The modern makeup of brass bands: removing the clarinet, performing in street clothes, reducing key changes, simplifying melodies, and incorporating popular music; is indebted to the contributions of these groups (Raeburn, “Faith” 142).

**Economic Struggles of the New Orleans Musician**

The image of music in New Orleans has appealed to tourists for a long time, yet it fails to fully benefit the musicians. Although it provides frequent gigging opportunities, the tourism industry makes a commodity out of their art and stifles creative innovation. In cities like New York or Chicago, music is a business where people are constantly trying new things in order to make their mark. In New Orleans the focus is much more local, it is about playing what the audience wants to hear and having a good time. Venues want specific bands for specific events and “if you don’t play what they expect you to, you won’t get hired again” said one local bandleader (Atkinson 101). Some New Orleanian musicians favor this aspect. As one of them explained, it “causes musicians to have to be broad based” (Atkinson 102). Asher Ross has noticed that in his four years in the city, “trad” and brass bands have had less crossover, playing
in their own distinct style. This could be due to tourist pressures, and the need for bands to play a single sound rather than an eclectic set.

Tourism does not just present problems however; some say it benefits younger musicians. “Music has been used as a gang that kids got involved with, to develop a sense of who they are,” said a music educator at the University of New Orleans (Atkinson 102). Tourism allows these young people to make good money at an early age, and learn how to compete for attention on the streets where everyone can play. Ellis Marsalis warns that this can also cause children and adolescents to end their music education early based off brief success and not continue into jazz studies collegiate programs (Atkinson 102-103).

As a performing art, music is often overlooked in regards to economic regeneration because it is less quantifiable than manufactured goods. Yet in 1990, the New Orleans music industry had a national economic impact of $1.45 billion (Akinson 92). Also creating 38,000 jobs that year, it is hard to look past the revenue gains that music offers New Orleans. However, this money rarely makes it back to the musicians who struggle to make ends meet.

“Problem with this city. Is that we have all these world class musicians and they can’t make a living,” says Art Perry, seven-year resident of Gretna, LA and host of internet radio programs showcasing New Orleans music (Personal Interview). “You can ask a musician what band do you play with. and he’ll rattle off six or seven bands,” says Perry. For example, at the beginning of last year, Asher Ross had to play in seven bands just to make ends meet. Perry emphasizes that music is what draws people to the Big Easy, yet city officials refuse to take it seriously. Nashville calls itself the Music City and Austin has trademarked the slogan “Live Music Capital of the World” for itself, yet New Orleans “blow[s] em outta the water when it comes to music,” says Perry. The high concentration of music festivals in the city serves to
accentuate this point, leading The Society of American Travel Writers to rank New Orleans number one amongst America’s live music cities in 2009 (Ramsey). Jan Ramsey of Offbeat Magazine writes, “There is no reason why we can’t similarly ‘create’ New Orleans as a music city. It’s just going to take a bit of reorganization, strategy and mindset adjustment.”

Even if the city began supporting its local music more, it is unclear whether it would really assist musicians. New Orleans has been heavily advertising its big festivals such as the New Orleans Jazz Heritage Festival and the French Quarter Festival for years, yet when it comes to really honoring native music legends other than Louis Armstrong, the city does a superficial job. Perry remembers Louis Prima’s 100th birthday commemorative poster for the French Quarter Fest all over the city, yet when he visited Prima’s gravesite on the day of his death there was “nothing but a pile of dead flowers” (Perry Interview). With a 32-acre park and international airport named after Armstrong, this attempt at remembering Prima seems futile, something just to sell tickets for the festival rather than a genuine commemoration for a jazz great. Unfortunately “Saints” has gone hand-in-hand with this milking of nostalgia, symbolizing a city trying to reap the efforts of their musicians without giving them their fair due.
Chapter 4: Saints and Children’s Music Education

I first learned “When the Saints Go Marching In” during a piano lesson in grade school. I distinctly recall learning it in my exercise book right between “Kumbaya” and “Shave and a Haircut.” With a brightly colored cartoon picture of a brass band adorning the title bar, I was much happier to see this in front of me than another classical etude. In addition, I had already heard the melody somewhere, perhaps the schoolroom or a cassette tape. Nevertheless, knowing “Saints” made it much more approachable than other pieces in my repertoire.

For many children born at the end of the twentieth century, like myself, “Saints” was not organically integrated into our lives as it might have been in the early twentieth century. It was often thrust upon us in our musical education at an early age. Although more appealing to many kids than other nursery rhymes and patriotic songs, possibly because of its emphasis on marching, it is still a rudimentary piece associated with elementary school.

The Diffusion of Saints in Early Twentieth Century New Orleans

In New Orleans, “Saints” occupies a different territory. The song is a bad-tattoo of sorts. An expedient label for the city that is associated with tourists, which many of its musicians and residents despise. Still, it is a song that most children growing up in musical families will be taught either at home, on the job, or in school. This last domain, formal music education, is often overlooked by the masses as well as some scholars who love to embellish the natural-born talents of many jazz pioneers in the city. Jelly Roll Morton took piano lessons, just as many of today’s brass band players learned the basics of their horn in grade school. Still, in Morton’s time, before music education was standardized in the school system, one had to be fortunate enough to both find and afford a music instructor. “In New Orleans, all the boys came up the hard way. The
musicianship was a little poor. You see, the average boy tried to learn by himself because there were either no teachers or they couldn’t afford music lessons,” recalls Mutt Carey (Shapiro and Hentoff 26).

If this is the case, then how was “Saints” passed on by the brass bands who would have played it during early 1900s jazz funerals? The answer is rooted in the oral transmission of mentorship that pervaded New Orleans bands at the time. Armstrong, for instance, studied under Peter Davis at the Waif’s Home and then under Joe Oliver as part of his Creole Jazz Band. Although these exchanges were supplemented with sheet music, “Saints” itself is a simple enough tune that it can be taught without the need of manuscript. With a simple melody and harmony it is relatively easy for a beginner musician to hear, making it a great tune to be taught in an informal setting. These setting were often second line parades, where aspiring young musicians ears would be perched up, attentively listening to the sounds.

“The most miserable feeling a youngster in New Orleans can experience is to be in a classroom in school, studying, and hear a brass band approaching, swinging like crazy, then pass the school, and fade off in the distance. You will witness a lot of sad expressions in that room” – Danny Barker (Shapiro and Hentoff 15)

Armstrong also recalls hearing brass bands play in his childhood, he even remembers them playing “Saints” specifically (Stein 37, Teachout 35, 39). So, despite oral transmission playing a large part in the early education of “Saints,” it was dependent on pupils with interested ears and bandleaders with patience.

**Saints and Family Music-Making**

The cultural transmission of songs in America goes back centuries, as formal American music education itself is relatively young. Although singing-schools and tune books existed in the early nineteenth century, it was not until 1883 that music was added to the public school
curriculum. Prior to that, and well after that, the main secular music educator in America was the family. We first hear and partake in music as children with our parents, and carry this joy with us through life (Gingras 2). “Our families…lay the foundation for our musical identity, ability, achievement, and future” (Gringas 1). Music creates a powerful bond between child and parent, allowing them to express themselves in ways other than speech that is why children raised in a musical setting are much more likely to continue playing into adulthood (Gingras 4, 9). Although family music-making is highly uncommon these days, it was once a staple of American home life. Since this country’s founding, families have passed down their songs through the generations. In the late nineteenth and early twentieth centuries, when the piano became affordable to the working-class, this music-making was raised to the next level and families could engage in more popular and folk songs (Gringas 12). With the emergence of sheet music publications, families could gather around the piano and sing their favorite spirituals, traditional songs, and/or popular tunes. “Saints” followed right along with this trend, being printed in many mid-twentieth century songbooks: from Hall Johnson’s *The Green Pastures* African-American spirituals book to *Frank & Jim: The McCravy Album of Fireside Songs* for vocals and piano (4-5; 20-21).

The recording industry has greatly diminished the family’s role in music education. It has turned music for an “activity to a thing,” as the ease in listening to a CD or iPod makes it more appealing than playing campfire tunes (Small 199 via Gringas 10). Still, evidence of traditional family music-making exists in modern America, and “When the Saints Go Marching In” is still a part of it. In Patricia Gringas’s dissertation at the University of Rochester in 2012, she observed five suburban middle-class family’s interactions with music. One of these interactions was a 6 year-old girl singing a variation of “Saints” to her brother on the treadmill.
With the brother nearing the 100th mile mark, she sang jokingly, “Oh, I want to be in that number, When Frankie goes over one hundred!” (Gringas 114). The siblings had encountered the song on the Nintendo Wii videogame *Just Dance Kids*, where players dance along to familiar popular and traditional tunes. What is interesting about the girl’s use of the song outside the context of the game is that it shows she knew it well enough to perform it without instrumentation and had a deep enough understanding to parody it. This improvisational aspect of just a brief domestic scene, shows that “Saints” is still relevant to today’s youth, and they know of its celebratory and extemporaneous nature.

It should be said however, that the girl’s family is more musical than the average family. With weekly family jam sessions and a Dixieland pianist for a grandma, she does not have the typical family structure. Yet, I know the song, and I am the only musician in my family. Nowadays, it does not matter how musical one’s upbringing is, because children are likely to learn “Saints” in school. However, the focus on American spiritual and folk music is a recent addition to the music curriculum in American public schools.

**Saints and the Development of American Music Education**

In the beginning, religious music, of the Christian church, was used in schools to teach music. Educators would set the words of hymns to famous pieces by prominent Western European composers, such as Bach and Beethoven (Branscome 14). Between 1900 and World War II, the development of solfege syllables spurred a gradual emphasis on the study of patriotic music (Branscome 16). It was not until the 1950s that culture was stressed in music education; this was with the introduction of the Orff and Kodaly methods. These methods focused on improvisation, melodic lines, and accompaniment patterns of folk songs (Branscome 17).
In 1994, the National Association for Music Education (MENC) decided to standardize the curriculum of music education by adding these nine elements:

1. Singing, alone and with others, a varied repertoire of music
2. Performing on instruments, alone and with others, a varied repertoire of music
3. Improvising melodies, variations, and accompaniments
4. Composing and arranging music within specified guidelines
5. Reading and notating music
6. Listening to, analyzing, and describing music
7. Evaluating music and music performances
8. Understanding relationships between music, the other arts, and disciplines outside the arts
9. Understanding music in relation to history and culture

Since then, music books have been incorporating lessons using these components to teach their students an array of skills. “Saints” is a great tune for this because it contains all nine elements. It can be sung/played in unison or alone, it has a large solo section, it can be arranged and notated, its performers must be attentively listening, and it is inherently linked to American culture by way of the African American.

Uses of Saints in Music Education Literature

Silver Burdett Ginn’s *Music Connection* series, published in 1995, features “Saints” in four of its volumes. The series follows elementary school music education, starting with first grade going until eighth grade. “Saints” appears in the first grade edition and is used to teach students to listen for specific instruments. With a full-page colored-illustration of various instruments, the students are instructed to focus on the tone and color of what they hear in the recording. Additionally the teacher is advised to get the kids involved in marching and hand clapping (Beethoven 27). One can envision a group of five-six year-old children walking around a classroom pantomiming trumpets and trombones. The second line is portrayed as a joyous
occasion, with a picture in the kid’s textbook of several children, each of a different racial background, smiling and marching along with chirping birds and salivating dogs (Beethoven 8).

“Saints” is not mentioned again in *The Music Connection* series until the sixth grade curriculum, where it sees use through the eighth grade volume. It seems the tune is introduced early on to showcase marching band music, and brought up again later as an example of a recognizable melody students can relate to. “Saints” is featured in the sixth edition’s chapter on I-IV-V7 Chords (Beethoven 277). The text is assuming that by sixth grade, students have “Saints” in their ear and can use it to help them understand this common chord progression. Also in the sixth grade edition, the first mention of New Orleans appears. With a photograph of the Preservation Hall Jazz Band in the student’s edition, the instructor is told to teach his/her students about collective improvisation and the oral transmission of African-American music (Beethoven 227-8).

The seventh grade edition of *The Music Connection* features “Saints” once again, this time to explain performing in ensembles, specifically jazz band. (Beethoven 178-9). Again, the text acknowledges the students’ prior knowledge of tune, “You’ve probably sung or heard this song before. Try singing it now.” (Beethoven 178). The students are taught about Dixieland jazz, where “each player in turn improvises on the melody while all the others provide a little harmonic support” (Beethoven 178). The teacher’s edition also presents a brief history of “Saints,” going from spirituals to Dixieland. Although most of the information in this section is correct, it makes a glaring error about Preservation Hall’s age at “two-hundred” years (Beethoven 179). Apart from this misconception about the age of the building and the organization itself, *The Music Connection* handles “Saints” very well, incorporating its social, historical, and musical contexts fluidly and consistently from first to eighth grade.
Specifically the historical and social contexts are popping up in today’s music literature. “Saints” is often being used as a springboard to discuss the social impact of New Orleans culture and jazz music on the American mainstream. In Loretta Norgon’s *Get America Singing…Again! Strategies for Teaching Lesson Ideas and Activities for Meeting the Standards* (2003), a songbook on teaching music students standards, she emphasizes the traveling nature of the song’s history. First, the text tells the instructor to simply ask their pupils where they’ve heard the song (Norgon 87). Then, it guides the teacher to explain African-American spirituals, gospel music, and finally Dixieland. “Frequently played during New Orleans funeral processions…on the way back [from the cemetery] the mood changed to a celebration…‘When the Saints Go Marching In’ was one of those celebration songs,” writes Norgon. Despite incorrectly crediting Katherine Davis and James Black for composing the song, she does a good job of integrating the song’s rich history and its musical contributions (i.e. improvisation). These examples show that although there is a lot of good literature on the tune, they are riddled with several common misconceptions about “Saints.”
Conclusion

At this point in the history of “When the Saints Go Marching In,” it is fair to say, the originators, whoever they may have been, would not have expected to experience “Saints” in its current manifestations. I doubt Louis Armstrong even, could have foreseen the tune’s presence in children’s education. This is true of many enduring songs, the meaning and uses have completely shifted from their original intents. This paper has tracked “Saints” from its earliest moments in the African-American spiritual tradition to its modern presence in a dancing videogame for kids. The future of the tune is anybody’s guess. I personally think the song will continue to exist as a New Orleans tourist cliché and children’s study tool for a few more decades. That being said, I cannot imagine a life for the song after this point. I doubt that in fifty years, the average American will be able to whistle “Saints” upon request. This prediction is in part based of the increasingly mixed demographic composition of the United States and the trend of older songs to fall out of favor. Fifty years from now, New Orleans musicians could be playing Rebirth and Soul Rebels Brass Band originals as examples of traditional songs, and music teachers might be using The Beatles and Michael Jackson to teach children. The nature of music is that it constantly shifts through time. The study of jazz, for example, would have been unheard of fifty years ago, yet now it is present in nearly every American high school and university.

Although I am very pleased with the progress and final shape of this paper, I wish I could have pursued certain topics further. One area I really want to focus on is post-Katrina New Orleans. In Spike’s Lee documentary on the hurricane, When The Levee Breaks: A Requiem in Four Acts, there is a scene where the Hot 8 Brass Band is playing “Saints” in Times Square. The band had been living there since fleeing Louisiana after the storm, and was playing “Saints” in the street. “Saints” was a way for them to sell themselves to passersby, as an authentic New
 Orleans band. This connection between “Saints” and displaced New Orleanians, specifically musicians, and their return home following Hurricane Katrina, is a fascinating subject. Although in the city, the tune is dreaded, it seems that it is also a tender reminder of home for those no longer in New Orleans. Another aspect of the post-Katrina life of “Saints” is its link with the NFL team. Although in 1967, when the New Orleans Saints were founded, the owner needed approval from the city’s archdiocese to use the name, Al Hirt, the team’s music director, explained that it came from “the jazz standard and had nothing to do with religion” (“All Saints Day”). Nowadays the tune is a rally cry for the team, containing the “who dat” addendum, preaching the team’s superiority.

I also hope to investigate the Virgil and Stamps connection more closely. The sources I found that mention the two gospel songwriters are limited, so I am eager look more deeply into their backstory. Specifically, I want to find their version of “Saints” in a songbook, if it exists. This would certainly open up more questions regarding the song’s life prior to Louis Armstrong’s 1938 recording.

I also hope to include a larger section on the global impact of “Saints” in future editions. Although I touched briefly on the All Stars international presence in the 1960s, I would like to look at more modern examples of the globalization of “Saints.” I recently discovered two viral videos by a French entertainment company called Cifras, in which several kids are playing “Saints.” The videos have blown up on social media due to the kids’ excellent musicianship and enthusiasm for the music. Since these examples illustrate both “Saints” internationality and its connection to education, I would much like to investigate the sources of the video further.

I also would like to do more extensive ethnographic fieldwork for this project. Four days in New Orleans was barely enough to scratch the surface. Remember, I never actually heard
“Saints” played in a live setting while there. Obviously this is something I would like to experience, as well as more second line parades. I would also like to visit the Backstreet Cultural and New Orleans African American Museums, two places I planned to see in March but could not fit into my schedule. I could also use more time in the Hogan Jazz Archive, as there are several vertical files on New Orleans musicians which could prove useful to this paper. Apart from visiting these places and observing more concerts, I would also like to expand my interviews for the project. I hope to get the anecdotes of more early jazz and brass band scholars and musicians for the future iterations of this paper.

I am excited to pursue this project after graduation both independently and possibly as part of a graduate studies program. The scope of this Capstone is fairly wide, drawing from many different sources and methodologies, so there will always be more information to add. Professor Doctor mentioned that it could be a book someday, just as Kaskowitz’s dissertation on “God Bless America” became a book. Although I cannot imagine this now, if this paper becomes a more comprehensive dissertation, it would be awesome to have it published more widely if there is an audience for it.
Appendix

Keep-N-It-Real
Social Aid & Pleasure Club
2015 Second Line Parade Route
No. 57. When the Saints are Marching In.

KATHARINE E. PURVIS. J. M. BLACK.

1. Thro' the shining gate, Where the angels wait, When the saints are marching in, The Redeemed shall come, And be crowned at home,
2. Part-ed friends shall meet, On the golden street, When the saints are marching in, Spotless robes shall wear, Victor's palms shall bear,
3. Ev'-ry tongue and race Shall extol God's grace, When the saints are marching in, And the blood-wash'd throng Shall repeat the song,
4. "To the Lamb once slain, But who lives again, When the saints are marching in, We shall offer praise Thro' e-ter-nal days,

CHORUS.

When the saints are marching in, When the saints are marching in,

When the saints, When the saints

in, When the saints are marching in, Joy-ful are marching in, When the saints are marching in,

songs of salvation thro' the sky shall ring, When the saints are marching in, When the saints are marching in.
827 St. Philip St. New Orleans, L.A. The former site of George Lewis’ Home. Where Bunk Johnson recorded “Saints” on Friday May 18, 1945 in the backyard (Personal Photograph, 10 March 2015)
A group of tourists on a guided tour stop outside Preservation Hall on 726 St. Peter Street
New Orleans, LA (Personal Photograph, 10 March 2015)
A magnet for sale in the Preservation Hall gift shop, a replica of the infamous sign inside the hall itself (Personal Photograph, 10 March 2015)
The gateway entrance to Louis Armstrong Park on a rather eerie day (Personal Photograph, 10 March 2015)
A “Who Dat” sign in a souvenir shop referencing the lyrical addition to “Saints” and showing the storeowner’s support of the local football team (Personal Photograph, 11 March 2015)
TBC Brass Band playing during Keep-In-It-Real’s second line parade (Personal Photograph, 8 March 2015)
TBC Brass Band snare drummer, Hasaan Goffner, and his even younger counterpart in the blue plaid shirt, who marched along with his own toy snare (Personal Photograph 8 March 2015)
Works Cited


Perry, Art. Personal Interview. 11 March 2015. Fresco Café. 7625 Maple St., New Orleans, LA.


Ross, Asher. Personal Interview. 08 March 2015. Garden District House. 1660 Annunciation St, New Orleans, LA.


**Music Recordings**


Frank Luther Quartette. “When the Saints Go Marching Home.” Decca 5051 B, 1934. digitized 78 rpm.

Wingy Manone & his Orchestra. “When The Saints Go Marching In.” Bluebird 10560, 6 September 1939. digitized 78 rpm.


The Original Pinettes Brass Band. Finally. 2011. CD.


Videos


Keep-In-It Real Second Line Parade. 8 March 2015. footage by Greg Jacks. taken on Samsung Galaxy Victory phone.
