The distinction between ethnocide and genocide, which is clear in principle, is often unclear and imprecise in practice. A successful ethnocide can leave a broken-spirited people who have relinquished the will to live. An imperial culture can use a variety of means to destroy a technologically inferior one. It can destroy a subject culture’s ecology, its traditional economy, its forms of political and social organization, and its religion. Techniques of destruction range from a seemingly mild belittlement of the subject culture’s values to overt oppression. Perhaps the most brutal methods used are transmigration of dominant peoples into the subject culture’s geographic domain and the abduction of the subject culture’s infants and children from that domain.

Ethnocide occurs when the culture of a people is destroyed, and the continued existence of the group as a distinct ethnic identity is thereby threatened. The physical destruction of the people is not necessary, but it often occurs simultaneously. Ethnocide has been particularly virulent against indigenous minorities under processes of colonial expansion, state development programs, and nation-state building. Despite being a worldwide phenomenon, it has only recently been acknowledged by academics and international agencies. Ethnocide is rarely successful, however, and cultural resurgence of the oppressed group is a common consequence.

Ethnocide and Genocide Contrasted

In its most simple form, the term ethnocide refers to the destruction of a culture. It is conceptually distinct from genocide, which is the intention to physically destroy a people, and while both are often pursued simultaneously, ethnocide, unlike genocide, can be achieved without the death of the people concerned. In a great many cases, however, the distinction between the two is less clear, and successful ethnocide can leave a broken-spirited people who have relinquished the will to live.

Although the practice of ethnocide is historically and geographically widespread, the term itself is not widely used. There are a number of reasons for this. One reason has been the tradition among anthropologists and ethnographers of academic objectivity while they study the changes that traditional cultures have
undergone due to contact with state policies or with modern and different cultures. The subject of their study has often been ethnocide, yet, because they have assumed the stance of impartial observer, they have been unwilling to speak out and condemn the destruction they have witnessed. A number of less emotive concepts have been used in place of ethnocide, such as acculturation—the modification of a culture as it comes into contact with a dominant culture; deculturation and detribalization—the breakdown of tribal social cohesion, and increasing participation of the individuals within a wider society; and assimilation—the absorption of a people into a dominant culture while requiring that their specific cultural distinctiveness be left behind. The concepts themselves deny the negative and destructive processes involved in such change.

Academics have also had recourse to theories which stress the natural progression of all societies as they develop, modernize, and industrialize. These theories assume that outmoded cultures are "primitive," "backward" and "underdeveloped," in which the people are denied admirable human qualities and are often likened to animal-like states. The solution for these anachronistic cultures is understood to be the inclusion of the people into the modernizing culture of the state and its forms of organization: the destruction of pre-modern cultures has been considered inevitable.¹

Ethnocide and Development

A second reason why the concept is not widely used is that ethnocide is usually pursued, or is covertly condoned, by a state under wider policies of development, modernization, or nation building. It is not in the interests of the developers or of the state for their actions to be labelled as ethnoidal. Measures taken to prevent this include outright denial of the consequences of their actions, preventing knowledge of their activities from leaking out to a critical public by prohibiting entry to the region, making special provisions for the people in question which look good on paper but not in practice, and cloaking their activities under more acceptable terms such as assimilation into the national culture.

Organizations to Protect Indigenous Peoples

Another reason for the new emphasis on ethnoidal situations has been the growth of international organizations such as Survival International, Cultural Survival, and the International Work Group on Indigenous Affairs, which campaign to raise public awareness of the plight faced by many indigenous peoples, and to support their struggles for cultural and physical survival. A number of recently published international symposiums and declarations by concerned academics and specialists have added voice to the international condemnation of ethnoidal projects. Examples of these are the Declaration of Barbados, 1971, and the UNESCO Conference on Ethnic Development and Ethnocide, San Jose, 1981.

Although there is growing public awareness of ethnoidal acts being carried out against indigenous people, it is important to remember that it also occurs in modern states against minority cultures, such as against the Ukrainians in the USSR, the Hungarians in Romania, and the Kurds in Turkey and Iraq.

Forms of Ethnocide

The destruction of cultural identity can refer to the destruction of artistic artifacts, intellectuals, artists, religious icons, and others; and in a wider sociological sense, it can mean the destruction of a group's social organization. This can take many forms. The following are some of the most recurrent ones:

a) The eco-system which forms the basis of a people's social and economic system is destroyed. For example, the construction of the Kautokeino dam in the Norwegian tundra destroyed the fragile reindeer pastoralism upon which Saami culture is based and resulted in a considerable loss of Saami identity.² Another form, deforestation, has occurred in Sarawak, and has changed the indigenous peoples' swidden farming, causing the disintegration of their societies.³

b) People are forced into new forms of economic organization which, though they commonly fail, divide societies, establish different bases of prestige and authority, and incur starvation, debt, and exploitation. One of the two most common reasons for economic reorganization is to permanently settle a population whose traditional economy rotates seasonally over a large area. Permanent settlements increase the ability to control a population, to minimize resistance organizations, and to enable large areas of land to be taken for development projects. The second reason is to include previously excluded people within the dominant economy, so that they may be used as a cheap form of labor. For example, in the late nineteenth and early twentieth centuries, Australian Aborigines were included in white society as cattle-station hands and as domestic servants.

c) Traditional forms of authority and political organization are purposefully destroyed or undermined. This is often linked to economic reorganization, such as in the Amazon region of Peru where the cohesion of Indian communities has been fragmented as individu-
als are tempted away by the promise of a piece of land which they can own themselves. Also, individuals with knowledge or wealth connected to the "new" economy can assume greater prestige and power than the traditional political figures, as happened in the traditional politico-religious hierarchies of the Aguacatan Indians of Guatemala. The authority of religious leaders is commonly targeted, as in Guatemala where shamans are being annihilated by hired killers.

d) Projects are established to include a people within the state's homogenizing cultural identity while their culture is excluded. Two means of achieving this are commonly pursued. In states where a minority culture is more or less integrated, their culture is denied expression as state education instructs students in the state's official language and the suppressed culture is written out of history. Mother-tongue publications and even traditional naming of children may also be forbidden. An example is the "Rumanianization" policies against the Hungarian minority in Rumania from 1948. The other form is the "civilization" of indigenous peoples deemed by the state to be "primitive" and "backward." This includes forsaking oral traditions and often their own language in favor of learning to read and write; donning western-style clothes; adopting western-style codes of morality; adopting a different work ethic; and replacing traditional religious and belief systems for the state religion.

e) The most active religious ethnocidal programs in recent history have been policies of Christianization. These were forcefully pursued in European colonization from the fifteenth century when the Spanish Conquistadors landed at Santo Domingo in 1492; they continue today, particularly in South America. The relationship between the religious missions and the state is not fixed; it is variable, subject to the extent to which their objectives are compatible. For example, the Council of the Catholic missions in the Brazilian Amazona condemned a state policy launched in the 1970s to remove the protected status of certain Indian groups and organized successful protest against the government. The Protestant Summer Institute of Linguistics, on the other hand, receives state support as it operates as mediator between the indigenous people and state development projects in a large number of states. In nineteenth century Australia, state funding for missionary projects was gradually decreased due to the missions' failure to produce sufficient numbers of transformed Aborigines.

f) Working closely with the methods outlined in the above two forms is the denial of a culture's distinct identity or reality by the dominant culture. In Venezuela, for example, the "Indian problem" has been "solved" by the official declaration that there are no Indians, but all are Venezuelans. Similarly in Ecuador, the separate identity of the Quicha Indians is negated as they are officially categorized in the general mestizo ethnic group. A different form of denial is the manufacture of cultural stereotypes that become the dominant language by which a people is known. For example, degrading and simplistic stereotypes of North American Native Peoples form the basis of white knowledge of these separate cultures, denying their reality and history and exerting considerable influence on policy making in Indian affairs.

g) Transmigration is another means by which ethnocide might be achieved. This refers to state policies which transfer large numbers of people from the dominant culture into a region where the minority culture that already inhabits the area is demographically overwhelmed. The minority culture then becomes a minority in its own land. This has occurred in Tibet where hundreds of thousands of Chinese have been relocated throughout the Tibetan provinces, on short-term but financially rewarding employment contracts. It is also the policy of Indonesia, where Javanese peasants have been transferred to Irian Jaya and Balinese farmers to East Timor. Transmigration is usually accompanied by some of the other measures already discussed to forcibly repress the minority culture.

h) In some situations children of the minority culture have been systematically abducted to be brought up within the dominant culture. The premise of abduction is that the younger the children are, the less they will have been exposed to the culture of their parents and the easier it will be for them to forget it and to learn a new culture. Consequently, even babies are taken. In this way, it is hoped that the removal of future generations will prevent the continued survival of the minority culture as a distinct group. This was a widespread state policy in Australia during the first half of this century when children, particularly those with some degree of white ancestry, were kidnapped and placed in Christian missions or in white homes to be raised as servants. Such was the fear of forcible separation from their children that many parents denied to themselves their own and their children's Aboriginality. In Tibet, thousands of children have been forcibly sent to China for secondary education, which is taught in Chinese. For the children, this means seven years of forced exile and isolation from their own culture.
A final form of cultural destruction that might be included is ideological colonialism in which any cultural expressions—using culture in both senses—which predate or oppose the particular state ideology are purged. The most obvious of these have occurred in communist regimes, such as in Tibet, where the Buddhist religion, its buildings, books, statues, monks, and nuns were systematically victimized and destroyed by the Chinese communists as expressions of anti-Chinese Tibetan nationalism, and where the traditional economic organization was forcibly reorganized and redistributed. Within China itself, in Peking, pre-communist buildings, statues, and other "symbols of Old China" were destroyed so that a new "symbol of socialist China" might be constructed. In Cambodia also, the era of the communist Khmer Rouge, 1975-1979, systematically destroyed all elements of modern, pre-communist lifestyles, such as middle classes, health personnel, urban dwellers, techniques and implements of modern technology, and forms of social organization based upon the family group. In some of these cases it might be plausible to apply the term "autoethnocide" (i.e., ethnocide against one's own people in a similar sense to how) "autogenocide" is used by the United Nations in reference to Cambodia.

The "other side" of these ethnocidal measures is often the establishment of special reserves or camps for the displaced people. This is a widely practiced policy and may, under certain conditions, act as a prelude to genocide (see below). The transference of people to reserves can be both voluntary, as with the hill tribes of Thailand, where the state administration encourages Hmong settlement in the lowland camps but does not force it; or forcible, such as in Paraguay, where the Ache Indians are hunted and often killed and the remnant rounded up and forced into camps, which are usually isolated and guarded. For the Ache there is no hope of escape. Conditions are unsanitary and there is very little medical aid or food; violence, sexual abuse, starvation, and death are common place and the living are reduced to states of abject despondency with little will or strength to survive.

The Question of Intent

The crime of ethnocide has not been established in international law in the same way that genocide was established by the 1946 United Nations Convention. The question of the intentions of those causing ethnocide remains a crucial issue however, since Article II(e) of the United Nations Convention—"Forcibly transferring children of the group to another group"—includes a specific form of ethnocide within its area of jurisdiction. In at least this form, then, establishing the intentions behind the transfer of children can determine whether or not the action can be punished by international law. This may set a precedent for other forms of ethnocide to become embodied in international law as criminal activities. The establishment of ethnocide as an international crime is the second reason why "intent" is important: the consolidation of a solid body of documentation which clearly demonstrates the intentional destruction of distinct cultural groups will add weight to this demand. At present ethnocidal activities are roughly included in a range of international covenants such as the International Covenant on Economic, Social and Cultural Rights (1976) but these can lack specificity and are not necessarily legally binding.

While many cases of ethnocide have clearly been intended to destroy the distinct cultural identity of a specific group of people, others are less clear. The rapid expansion of state development projects might, at times, not intend to bring cultural destruction since planning commonly alludes to vast tracts of empty wilderness. The use of this myth is not satisfactory, however; sufficient data clearly document the necessary small population-to-area ratio that is necessary for many indigenous cultures to survive in a fragile ecosystem. By resorting to the "empty wilderness" myth, policy decisionmakers consciously override the existence of those inhabiting the land, and ignore the destructive effects of their policies; they also impose a particular set of laws on land ownership that are clearly not recognized by the indigenous people, whose own traditional laws are negated.

Another example is the intentions of many missionaries which in some cases have been not so much destructive as salvational, hoping to raise "Satan-worshipers" to a higher spiritual and civilized level of humanity. The establishment of reserves, supposedly to protect the physical and cultural survival of a people, is another difficult area in which to gauge intentions. The reality of the reserves can serve to expose their destructive consequences, as Richard Arens forcefully demonstrated in his tour of four reservations at the request of the Paraguayan state. Despite all of this, policymakers might continue to declare that their intentions were honorable.

A further reason why the intentions behind any policy are considered is that change is endemic to all societies. It is important to establish where change has been generic, coming from within the society itself; where it has been forcibly imposed from outside of the community; and where people have welcomed change brought about by contact with outside cultures as a means to rid themselves of outmoded or unwanted internal forms of organization—a form of chosen adaptation. Only the second type of change can be considered ethnocidal.
Interactions of Ethnocide and Genocide

While the definitions of genocide and ethnocide may be relatively distinct, in practice they often confusingly interact. It is helpful to distinguish the main forms that this interaction might take.

a) Ethnocide might be a more viable alternative to genocide. If the objective of policy is to remove a people whose continued traditional lifestyle is considered to be an obstacle to some larger aim, such as a development project, a number of solutions are possible (e.g., ethnocide, genocide, or expulsion). Due to insufficient analyses of cases, it is not yet possible to clearly establish which conditions are necessary for the pursuit of these different options. One factor which might be influential in the choice of ethnocide rather than genocide is the extent to which international spotlights are focused upon the situation. International pressure does not necessarily result in a change of policy, yet it may be sufficient in some cases to encourage a change from overt genocidal policies to more covert ethnoidal ones under the protective guise of "assimilation" or "reservations."

A second possible factor is that, once the "obstacle" has been removed through physical destruction, ethnoidal policies might be continued against the survivors for whom no "use" can be found to ensure their continued powerlessness and dissolution. This may have been the case in Queensland, Australia, during the late nineteenth century where isolated reserves were established for the dispirited and abused Aborigines who had survived the violent onslaught of frontier expansion. From these survivors, whose traditional lifestyles and communities had been destroyed, those who were not integrated into the dominant white economy were randomly and forcibly transferred to the reserves where it was assumed they would naturally die out as a race. The example highlights a third possible factor—the extent to which the population of an unwanted culture can be incorporated, albeit often forcibly, into the dominant economy.

b) Ethnocide might act as a prelude to genocide. Certainly genocidal Nazi policies were augmented at the Wannsee Conference in 1942. Prior to this, Jews, Gypsies, and other targeted groups were subjected to ethnoidal practices. During Kristallnacht, synagogues were set ablaze the length of Germany. Families and communities were torn apart and deprived of their means of livelihood as they were redistributed throughout Europe or confined in isolated ghettos. In early colonial Australia, assimilationist policies towards the Aborigines were initially encouraged, yet their continued failure fueled impatience and encouraged frontiersmen to use violence as a means to end the Aborigine obstacle.

c) Ethnocide and genocide might be pursued simultaneously. This is perhaps the most common form of interaction for several reasons. First, little discrimination may be made in the means of removing the "obstacle" culture and both are seen as effective and complementary measures. In some cases, certain segments of a population might be spared from genocide if they are thought to be useful and are subject to ethnoidal policies. For example, far greater numbers of women and young girls found on the Ache reservations in Paraguay have been attributed to their use as sexual chattels for camp guards. Second, ethnoidal policies commonly result in genocide—they are a means of achieving the physical destruction of a people. The destruction of the ecosystem on which a society depends often leads to starvation, as do failed attempts to force economic reorganization upon a people with insufficient resources. People removed to reservations face death from starvation, lack of sanitation or medical support, and violence; having survived total disruption of their lives and grief from physical separation from loved ones, they also commonly lose the will to live and see death as a welcome release.

Ethnogenesis

In spite of the widespread enactment of ethnocide throughout the globe, a number of peoples facing cultural destruction have reasserted their distinct identities and successfully struggled against the policies which oppress them. This counter resurgence is a widespread phenomenon which has gained momentum from international voluntary and statutory agencies, such as the International Work Group on Indigenous Affairs and Cultural Survival; from the church in a number of cases such as the Jesuit church in Paraguay, and from the establishment of pan-identities to fight a common struggle, such as the Pan-Andean Indians. Significantly, younger people who have directly experienced assimilationist policies are rejecting the values and lifestyles of the dominant cultures, and are fighting for a future in the traditional culture of their people.

Given the extent to which ethnogenesis occurs, it seems sensible to conclude that, while ethnoidal policies are relatively easy to pursue, it is less easy for them to succeed. The apparent optimism that this suggests has a considerable negative side; ethnocide is a less successful means than genocide to achieve the objective of removing a distinct cultural identity.
NOTES


15. Tibet Support Group, UK Fact Sheet (February 1989).


24. Munzel.


26. Munzel.

27. Branford and Glock.


Chapter 1: Annotated Bibliography

Readers are advised to consult the many publications of international agencies such as the International Work Group on Indigenous Affairs, Survival International, Cultural Survival, the Minority Rights Group, and the Anti-Slavery Society. The following represent a small selection from a vast wealth of literature on cultural destruction.

* 1.1 *

The Ablin and Hood collection of papers emanating from the Conference on "Kampuchea in the 1980's," held at Princeton University in 1982, considers the legacy Cambodia inherited from almost a decade of war and violence. Of particular interest are the chapters by May Ebihara, which includes analysis of the destruction of key basic social institutions—"the family, village, and wat" (p.23)—by the Khmer Rouge, their replacement by rural communities, and the result this had upon individual status; and David R. Hawk, which considers the violations of international human rights in Democratic Kampuchea, 1975-1979, and the physical and cultural destruction waged against minority ethnic groups and religious practices, particularly Buddhism.

* 1.2 *

Israel established the Kahan Commission of Inquiry to investigate the massacres of Shatila and Sabra camps for Palestinian refugees in West Beirut in 1982. Ahmad assesses the commission's recommendations. He emphasizes two elements: 1) the commission represents a historical pattern in which key figures are absolved of direct responsibility by a judicial system that is ideologically bound to its political counterpart; and 2) this pattern is enthusiastically endorsed by representatives of Western public opinion. Ahmad argues that "this pattern does not merely hold; rather, it is now extended to cover up a policy of ethnocide"; he outlines connections between mass violence and extermination, dispersal and expulsion, and ethnocide in Israeli policies as attempts to "solve" the "Palestinian problem" in the occupied territories.

* 1.3 *

Institutionalized racism in United States-controlled Guam has led to the cultural oppression of the indigenous Chamorro people. The article specifically refers to the Pacific Daily News (PDN), Guam's single newspaper, and its links via corporate finance to United States proposals to exploit the mineral wealth in the oceans of Micronesia. Reference is also made to ethnocide and genocide in Guam since the onset of colonialism in 1521. The conclusion is optimistic: Chamorro nationalists successfully forced the PDN to reverse its English-only language policy in the 1970s.

* 1.4 *

A short supplement to Arens' 1976 publication, this document tells of the author's own visit to Indian reservations at the invitation of the Paraguayan state. The Minister of Defence is cited as stating official policy to be the integration of the Indians, understood by the author to mean instant "sedentarization," causing suffering and death. Four camps are visited, three of which compound the processes of deculturation outlined in Genocide in Paraguay, and which reveal the consequences of ethnocide—"abject depression" and "psychic death" (p.3). The fourth reserve, which did not pursue a policy of enforced sedentarization, was found to be devoid of these symptoms. A short section is included on a subsequent conference at the Ministry of Defence which shows the official response to be denunciation of allegation of genocide and slavery. The report concludes that ethnocide and genocide against the Indians is the "final solution" to those obstacles to the state's plan of deforestation.

* 1.5 *

Arens has assembled and edited a disturbing and important collection of papers by leading experts on the genocidal and ethnical oppression of the Ache Indians by the Paraguayan state. Aches held captive on the government reservation were denied their traditional music and religion, adequate food, and medical services; their language was discouraged; and many were forced into slavery, particularly young girls who were used for sex.

Arens' introduction discusses the role of the international press and the American media; the federal government in particular is condemned for failing to publicize either the Ache's plight or American involve-
ment. Paraguayan officials have persistently denied allegations of atrocities.

The paper by Norman Lewis draws attention to the destructive missionary endeavors which received state endorsement. Chaim F. Shatan discusses the destruction of the Ache from a psychological perspective and refers to his previous analysis of Vietnam veterans. He also suggests the "rehumanization" of the Ache. Monroe C. Beardsley includes ethnocide within the United Nations' definitions of genocide while also recognizing it a crime in itself, often as a prelude to genocide. The obverse of ethnocide—the right to participate in one's own culture—is considered as a basic human right.

* 1.6 *

The authors have written a coherent examination of the policies by the Mexican federal government and regional development agencies to incorporate two indigenous ethnic groups into "the nationalist capitalist system of production and consumption." They argue that this is achieved through "the elimination of their economic semi-independence and cultural identity." (p.2). The construction of hydraulic dams in 1949 and in the 1970s demanded the resettlement of Indians into zones of ethnic heterogeneity and changed economies.

Discrimination and intentional social disorganization ensued. Nationalist policy denied the Indian traditional heritage of cultural pluralism so that "the policy of the indigenistas as carried out by the National Indigenista Institute was... explicitly directed towards the destruction of indigenous cultures and the integration of ethnic minorities into the lowest and most exploited stratum of the national structure." (p.18) Brief mention is made of an emergent messianic movement which has united the Chinantec and strengthened their traditional cultural affinity in the face of oppression.

* 1.7 *

Berglund questions the implementation of national integrationist policies in Chile and the subsequent abuse of human rights between 1970 and 1973. His study is based on comparative field work among Mapuche Indians and rural laborers and smallholders, and larger collective agricultural units which have undergone relatively successful organizational and economic reform. It is not confined to cultural considerations and includes economic and socio-political spheres. Part I examines these spheres within contemporary Mapuche society and includes quantitative data. Chapters 9 and 10 trace the history of Chilean integrationist policies from 1813 and land reform legislation from the 1960s. Part II concentrates upon national integration, defined as "a process in which reallocation of resources and power in favor of the majority is the main issue." (p.39) Given this, the question of maintaining Mapuche identity is inextricably linked to the question of land use and their relation with other land users. Berglund concludes that only class solidarity with other exploited, non-Mapuchean sectors can achieve their continued cultural existence and socio-political rights.

* 1.8 *

Bodley includes in this edited collection case studies and policy documents and assessments from the mid-nineteenth century onwards. The purpose of the volume is to understand the assumptions policy decision makers have made towards tribal groups. The central question it addresses is why development policy affecting indigenous peoples has such scant regard for their basic human rights and survival. The collection is intended to extend the main themes outlined in Bodley’s 1972 publication, Victims of Progress. Case studies are taken mainly from Amazona, the Arctic, Australia, Melanesia, South East Asia, and Africa. The 39 papers in the book are necessarily short and serve as appetizers for subsequent study, yet their selection and arrangement provide a comprehensive and varied portrayal of central elements in the global history of tribal destruction and exploitation. This is a useful introductory book, particularly for students of development and human rights issues.

* 1.9 *

In an important and useful publication, Bodley directly addresses the issues of ethnocide and genocide against indigenous peoples of the world under the ethnocentric dogma of industrialized civilization. The success of his book lies in his systematic coverage of all the major topics and angles of destruction, using a full range of historical and more contemporary cases to clearly illustrate each point. Chapter 10, which has been completely rewritten for this edition, argues that ethnocide is the result of a dominant realist philosophy among politicians and religious and scientific leaders over a 150-year period. Realist philosophy assumed
the inevitable extinction of tribal groups, or their integration into "civilized" society. The approach recognizes that indigenous people could not survive rapidly encroaching industrialization—yet their demise and disappearance warns us that global technological, social, and political advance needs to be balanced with humane considerations if cultures, societies, and world ecosystems are to have a future. It is a crucial political question since ethnocide has been the outcome of political decisions devoid of human rights. The appendices include a number of international declarations and human rights programs.

* 1.10 *

In a personalized account that is colored with numerous detailed examples, the authors investigate development problems in the Brazilian Amazon region. They deal mainly with the struggle by peasant farmers against powerful landowners, but also consider the purposes behind the state's transmigration policy, and its effect upon the indigenous landowners. Anti-Indian sentiment is found to be more overt among local landowners and politicians. Anger is focused upon Indian land occupation and is founded upon irrational hatred and ignorance of Indian culture. It is articulated in demands for the seizure of Indian lands and for their conformity to non-Indian work ethics.

An attempted state project of the 1970s to emancipate Indians with sufficient contact with national society was condemned by CIMI—the missionary council of the Catholic Church—as a deliberate policy of cultural extermination. It aimed to remove the protected status of Indian land ownership and was to be followed by the enforced division of land into family plots. The project was dropped in 1979 due to successful opposition. Space is also given to the activities of the strong Indian movement which operates at local and national levels.

* 1.11 *

Brintnall examines the transformation of the Aguacatan Indians of Guatemala, based on field work done in the 1970s. The study reveals a complex picture of interrelations in which deliberate exogenous destruction of traditional religious hierarchies occurs within a wider matrix of modernization, largely determined by the Aguacatan themselves. While these religious hierarchies suffered demolition under the Christianization policies of missionaries, particularly the Summer Institute of Linguistics, their destruction also instigated changes within the Indian groups, such as the abolition of traditional political structures and intergroup antagonisms, which increased the possibility for the Indians to pursue their new, liberationist, economic directives. This was a case of cultural destruction and integration rather than assimilation.

* 1.12 *

The authors analyze the war that has raged in East Timor since late 1975 against the expanding Indonesian state. The rationale for the study was the emergence of new information following a lull in the late 1970s, which challenged the assumption that the Timorese resistance had been successfully squashed. The authors purpose was to provide a "basis for renewed solidarity with the victims of Indonesian aggression." (p.xvii) It utilizes a range of documentary sources from the resistance movement, overseas aid organizations, the Indonesian press, and leaked 1982 instructions to Indonesian troops on "counter-insurgency operations." Many of these are presented in the second section of the book. Allegations of genocide and violence are made and Chapter 5 is specifically concerned with the program of Indonesianization pursued since 17 July 1976 after the adoption by the Indonesian Parliament of the Bill of Integration. The imposition of Indonesian political and social structures under military control rendered East Timorese second class citizens, constantly suspected of disloyalty to the Indonesian state. Similarly, the systematic, forced transition from traditional agriculture to plantations, and the transmigration of Balinese farmers to the region, had caused landlessness, forcible confinement in camps, famine, and increasing reliance upon relief agencies. Special attention has been paid to the massive construction of a standardized Indonesian educational system devoid of Timorese culture and history.

* 1.13 *

A publication of Tapol, the British organization concerned with the dissemination of information and defense of human rights in Indonesia, this book focuses on the military occupation of Irian Jaya, on the transmigration policy to settle one million Javanese in tribal areas, and on the Papuan resistance of the OPM, the Free Papua Movement. A consequence of Javanese settlement has been the dispossession of Papuan homelands with the subsequent disruption of existing
social structures and cultural destruction as displaced Papuans become urban fringe-dwellers, and are exposed to attempts to modernize them. The "Koteka operation" in the early 1970s against the Dani is singled out as the "most systematic of these attempts." A major factor in the violence of administering transmigration and modernizing programs is that it lies in the hands of the military. Papuans are portrayed as both primitive and a potential threat to Indonesian territorial defense against Papua New Guinea, warranting military intervention. Indonesian education omits all reference to Papuans and their culture. A further consequence of transmigration has been the upheaval of the ecological balance necessary for Papuan shifting horticulture, resulting in famine.

* 1.14 *

In this readily accessible book, Burger explores the present-day situation of indigenous people under threat from development projects, and their struggles for physical and cultural survival. The rapid rate of development is based upon two myths—that the land is wild and empty, and that it promises under-used resources that will solve state economic and political problems. The author includes a large number of cases spread throughout the world. Ethnocide is identified as the "one overwhelming and universal menace to indigenous peoples," while "assimilation into industrial society has brought few benefits and many hardships" as they become "part of the growing mass of landless and underemployed poor." (p.31) One chapter is dedicated to a discussion of governmental and international action and concludes that since governments are usually involved in the violation of human rights, "they pay little heed to the international instruments to which they are signatories. There is no guarantee, therefore, that the declaration of principles or any subsequent convention concerning the rights of indigenous peoples will have any meaningful impact..." (p.269).

* 1.15 *

In the Chittagong Hill Tracts in eastern Bangladesh, a war is being waged between the Shanti Bahini Peace Force of the indigenous hill people and Bangladeshi troops sent to the area by Dhaka to enforce state development plans. These plans to economically reorganize the Tracts into permanent, settled, and individually owned farms, and to construct the Kaptai Dam using large sums of foreign aid have attracted tens of thousands of Bengalis into the area. The consequence has been the destruction of tribal traditional shifting cultivation, dispossession of tribal lands and villages, economic exploitation, starvation, debt, violence, and the upheaval of traditional socio-political community organization. The tribal view of the onslaught is "at best, 'exploitation' but more commonly...ethnocide verging on genocide" (p.7), as recurrent massacres, arrests, and tortures coincide with Muslim troop violence aimed specifically at the tribal Buddhist religion.

* 1.16 *

The 1985 annual report from Survival International presents articles concerning the destruction wrought upon tribal peoples by projects for economic development under the ambit of nation-state building in India, Namibia, Nicaragua, and Latin America. The value of this collection lies in its demonstration that the form of destruction is specific to each case and is determined by a greater number of factors than are immediately apparent. The removal of people from their traditional lands appears as a common cause of cultural destruction—a threat faced by over two million people in central India due to the construction of hydroelectric dams in Maharashtra and Madhya Pradesh. Also included is a brief report on the ethnocidal policies of the Pinochet regime in Chile as experienced by the Mapuche Indians, and a collection of correspondence between Survival International and the World Bank which successfully halted a project that threatened the cultural survival of 6,700 Indians in West Central Amazona in Brazil.

* 1.17 *

Colletta challenges the orthodox perspective on development which views traditional cultures as antipathetic to economic advancement. A wide variety of examples are used to demonstrate that, contrary to conventional approaches, indigenous cultural forms can be adapted to achieve change. Development and modern state formation, it is argued, do not necessitate the destruction of existing cultures.

* 1.18 *

In Chapter 10 of this work, a new edition of his 1968 publication, Conquest concentrates specifically
upon the purge of cultural and scientific representatives and institutions of previous or "counter" ideologies. The intelligentsia, universities, and publishers were all targeted and widespread arrests, interrogations, and torture ensued. Conquest refers to this era as "a holocaust of the things of the spirit." (p.307) He also examines the horror of labor camps as ideological re-education centers for ideologically unsound peasants and intellectuals. The author's 1968 book was widely acknowledged to be the only authoritative historical work on the the Ukraine during the Stalinist era of the 1930s. See also 6.2.

**1.19**

Conquest analyzes Stalinist policies in the Ukraine between 1929 and 1933. He identifies two distinct processes—dekulakization and collectivization policies from 1929-1932; and imposed famine and ethnocide during 1932-1933, which attacked Ukrainian culture, intelligentsia, and religion. Ukrainian nationalism was singled out as the problem demanding resolution. Conquest makes use of a wide range of evidence to substantiate claims, including testimonies from survivors. This is a scholarly work from a highly respected authority. See also 6.3.

**1.20**

Dargyay's socio-anthropological study of small rural communities in Gyantse district is based upon interviews with Tibetan refugees in India and Switzerland in the 1970s. The Chinese occupation has brought about "the destruction of the traditional Tibetan culture," "alienation," and "flight." (p.4) Dargyay's reconstruction of traditional village life serves as a measure for change in the post-invasion period, which is examined in the final chapter.

**1.21**

Two journalists point the finger at those involved in perpetrating the cultural destruction of Indian and Inuit peoples in Arctic Canada under the general claim of development. Theirs is a lively book which locates the impact of Canadian and foreign state and private enterprises upon the native peoples, within a wider discussion of the United Nations Convention on Genocide. The limitation of the latter is identified and suggestions made for a more applicable, preventative approach to the issue. Ethnocidal policies aimed specifically at children forcibly transplant them to an alien educational system which denies their own culture. Recent ethnogenesis among the youth is noted.

**1.22**

In one of the first studies to do so, Davis draws attention to the fate of the Amazonian Indians under Brazilian economic development. He provides students of development and human rights with a thorough grounding in Brazilian Indian policy. The imposition of national and multi-national economic programs has disregarded these aspects of Brazilian law, and has had far-reaching consequences for indigenous and non-indigenous peoples everywhere. Davis' book is an extension to the arguments of Darcy Ribeiro on the central role of economic and political policy in the increasing physical and cultural extinction on Amazonian tribes, published in 1957, 1962, and 1970.

**1.23**

In a clearly presented argument, Devalle examines the contemporary economic and cultural oppression of the Adivasis population of India, particularly those in Bihar state. As the original inhabitants, the tribal identity of the Adivasis presents a problem to the creation of an integrated Indian identity by means of Sanskritization and Westernization policies. Two cultural and one economic solutions are identified: 1) the gradual replacement of traditional culture, particularly language and religion, through education—that is, detribalization; 2) a Rousseauian "noble savage" idealism purporting to isolate and preserve tribal groupings assumed to be stagnant; and 3), specific tribal development programs to integrate "inherently backwards" Adivasis into a larger, capitalist oriented, economic plan. All three seek to eliminate Adivasis culture and identity by denying Adivasis reality and any political or economic autonomy. Consequently, the centuries-long struggle of the Adivasis against their exploitation has recently been strengthened as they articulate for their own autonomous state and seek pantribal unity in agrarian resistance to imposed
capitalist development, and to defend their own cultures and identities.

* 1.24 *
Dorstal, W., ed. The Situation of the Indian in South America. Geneva: World Council of Churches, 1972. The Symposium on Inter-Ethnic Conflict in South America acted as a critical consultation to the World Council of Churches. All contributors to this volume are anthropologists or ethnographers with direct experience working with South American Indians. They address not only the role of church missions in the region but also political, industrial, and educational spheres. Their papers are confined to Indian groups which are less well documented.

A general introduction looks at the history of colonization in South America and argues that current cultural pluralism is a structural consequence of this history. Within this, Indian populations are subjected to economic exploitation under internal colonialism which is denied by the state's dominant sectors. Policies of Indian acculturation towards national integration center around "native problems (such as 'laziness', or being 'depraved' or 'inferior', which)...are (assumed to be)...essentially rooted in cultural differences, in the backwardness or inadequacy of the cultural norms of the natives in comparison with the dominant culture of the nation as a whole." (pp.25-26) This false perception of Indian reality perpetuates the disruption of meaningful integration. The collection ends with an interesting assortment of information, demographic data, critical bibliographies and the Declaration of Barbasos for the Liberation of Indians resulting from the symposium.

This is a highly useful book which condenses many of the main threats specific to each South American state within a single volume. It is a collection of papers first presented at the Symposium on Inter-ethnic Conflict in South America in January 1971 in Barbados at the behest of the World Council of Churches program to Combat Racism.

* 1.25 *

Elder's careful study of the demise of Batak identity is based upon extensive fieldwork between 1966 and 1981 on Palawan Island in the Philippines archipelago. The author's knowledge of the entire population and his detailed collection of data, which includes two extensive censuses set eight years apart, are invaluable to his focus upon internal changes in culture and social organization due to contact with migrating lowland Filipino farmers. A useful introduction discusses theoretical models for analyzing change in indigenous cultures and ethnocide, and challenges the widely used "victims of progress" model which is overly simplistic and resorts to stereotypes. The final chapter compares the case study with a number of tribal societies that successfully adapted to modernization forces. It leads to the conclusion that the Batak's failed adaptation is due to the loss of their specific ethnic identity through the erosion of their culture and their language. The study focuses upon internal change rather than state policy.

* 1.26 *

This unusual and important book has developed from the work of Link-Up (NSW), an organization formed to confront problems arising from a particularly insidious form of ethnocide, or indeed genocide. From the early twentieth century until the 1960s, Australian state policies systematically abducted Aboriginal children assumed to have mixed-race heritage and placed them in missionary and educational institutions, with foster families or as cheap or unpaid labor for whites. The objective was to force their adoption of white culture, thereby significantly eradicating Aboriginal culture. It was assumed that full-blooded Aborigines would naturally and quickly die out. It was hoped that this combination would solve the "Aborigine problem." The book contains testimonies from thirteen people born after 1950 who fought for reunification with their families and to reclaim their Aboriginal identity. They represent only a fragment of the picture, since the editors estimate that in contemporary Australia "there may be one hundred thousand people of Aboriginal descent who do not know their families or communities....some do not even know they are of Aboriginal descent." (p.ix)

* 1.27 *

In this interesting paper, Ervin concentrates upon the methods adopted by a threatened population to preserve its own identity. A process of transculturation has occurred among Alaskan Native leaders who made use of new access to positions of power and influence made possible by processes of assimilation and acculturation into the dominant American society, but did so in order to successfully maintain and strengthen their
What emerges is a multidimensional picture of destruction of native cultures. The collection is its revelation of the complexity of contact history. The contradictions between Tibetan rights under the Chinese constitution and their brutal fate under Chinese rule, are highlighted in Chapter 16, where barbarous examples are cited to demonstrate how Articles 11, 88, 89, and 96 have been broken. It is a highly readable account, chronologically ordered with much detail.

* 1.29 *

Gailey’s paper is an academic warning of the shortcomings of a structuralist approach to understanding the perpetuation of ethnic cultures over time. She argues that a structuralist perspective can result in a form of academic blindness which excludes other possible interpretations of cultural change wrought by contact with early European colonialism, such as ethnocide.

* 1.30 *

Gilbert’s useful and interesting book provides detailed information on the Nazi deportations of European Jews throughout the occupied territories. It brings to the fore the chaos of Nazi policy. Much of the book is given to maps of the journeys and is accompanied by a useful and upsetting text.

* 1.31 *

Goodman’s work is a biography of His Holiness the Fourteenth Dalai Lama. Although much of the book covers the pre-1950 period, a substantial section is dedicated to the sustained efforts to preserve Tibetan identity and culture despite the force of Chinese oppression. The difficulties of success are vividly explained and the changing forms of Chinese destruction are explored in detail. The contradictions between Tibetan rights under the Chinese constitution and their brutal fate under Chinese rule, are highlighted in Chapter 16, where barbarous examples are cited to demonstrate how Articles 11, 88, 89, and 96 have been broken. It is a highly readable account, chronologically ordered with much detail.

* 1.32 *

Hauptman’s book is a rare study of Iroquois nationalism from World War II to 1973 and the takeover at Wounded Knee. From the 1940s, retrogressive policy in the Bureau of Indian Affairs severely threatened the continuation of Iroquois culture in favor of programs for their total assimilation into white culture. A large part of the book reconstructs the continuing struggles between Iroquois representatives and United States policies.

* 1.33 *

Hernandez evaluates the impact of the El Cerejon coal strip mining project in northern Colombia upon the indigenous Guajiroos which “may indeed result in their extinction as a culture." (p.3) The report assesses the early phase of development, its planning, and Guajiro response. A number of recommendations are made to mitigate some of the detrimental effects of the project, including redistributing portions of land royalties to Guajiro communities, initiating ecological improvement schemes, and the development of health and educational centers which would include cultural programs to reassert Guajiro culture.

* 1.34 *

Hong analyzes the impact of land development, logging schemes, and the construction of hydroelectric dams upon the indigenous people of Sarawak and upon their subsequent resistance. The erosion of indigenous land rights, changes in forest laws and logging have destroyed traditional farming and ancestral sites.
Economic and ecological damage and malnutrition threaten the survival of the people. Cultural alienation and urbanization have occurred, specifically among the young, through the introduction of Western education, values and lifestyles. There is fear that traditional society will "fail to reproduce itself." (p.211) The book calls for state protection of the cultural identity of these people.

* 1.35 *

The Hvalkof and Aaby collection of anthropological papers critically examines the role of the American Summer Institute of Linguistics (SIL)—the largest organization of Protestant missionaries—among tribal groups throughout the world and particularly in Latin America. The first chapter introduces the reader to the development of SIL and stresses the equivocal position of missionaries working as mediators between Indians and expanding state development and military projects. The main thrust of SIL is to save indigenous and peasant people from Satan by translating the Bible into their respective languages, a policy recognized by the contributors as a form of cultural imperialism causing ethnocide. The remaining chapters amplify these themes with specific reference to local communities.

* 1.36 *

This work is a concise introduction to the main issues which threaten the survival of indigenous peoples today. The last section on international and national action considers the roles of governments, large finance corporations and industries, the United Nations, and other agencies.

* 1.37 *

Kewley's book is a compelling eye witness account of a Western journalist's clandestine investigation of Chinese genocide and ethnocide in Tibet. Personal impressions are supported by historical data to produce a well-rounded and informed perspective on the continuing Chinese policies of oppression. The crux of the book is the extensive interviews held with Tibetans who directly suffered under Chinese brutality, which Kewley compares to Nazi policies of the Holocaust. Ethnical policies, which continue to date, have been pursued coterminously with policies of genocide. The persistent policy of demographic relocation of Chinese into Tibet is another grave threat to the culture's survival. The dearth of data from the region, which is under extreme Chinese control, adds to the significance of the book.

* 1.38 *

The author discusses trends of cultural and political oppression of ethnic groups within Mediterranean states in a general paper that covers vast ground. Consequently it precludes the sophisticated analysis that would result from more detailed examination of cases.

* 1.39 *

In his short, provocative discussion of the concept of genocide, Legters seeks to extend its definition to include debilitating forms of mass destruction other than "the deliberate extermination of human life" alone. (p.770) He suggests that ethnocide—cultural genocide—be included under the term, referring to the histories of the Native American peoples.

* 1.40 *

Lewis' book consists of personal reminiscences of his encounters with missionary work among indigenous peoples, mainly in Latin America. He reveals the savage and relentless destruction caused by the North American fundamentalists.

* 1.41 *

The author lived among the Yanomami of the Upper Orinoco in Venezuela during the period of 1968-1975. In this work, he takes a short and direct look at the detrimental effects of missionary work on these people. Lizot argues that the missionaries are almost totally ignorant both of the complexity of the Yanomami traditional lifestyle and of the disastrous effects of their intervention. The economy, the social organization, enforced schooling at an isolated missionary institution, and health are singled out as areas where this is most evident. He attributes a decreasing population to malnutrition and disease, both inculcated by
whites. Lizot proposes that integration of the Yanomami into the national life is possible if the richness of their traditions is respected and included under the ambit of cultural pluralism.

* 1.42 *

*Governing Savages* is a highly readable account of official policies towards Australian Aborigines in the Northern Territory in the first half of this century. Three chapters introduce the main perspectives with which white settlers viewed Aborigines, while Chapters 4-11 each concentrate on a wide range of different institutions. Perhaps the most illuminating aspect of the book is the complexity of attitudes held by both individuals and institutions towards Aborigines, echoed in respective policies aimed at "solving" "the problems" that Aborigines represented to white invaders. Of these problems, the question of where people of mixed race were to fit into society was the most vexed. Ethnocidal policies were here resolutely pursued by a number of missionaries, more tentatively by various government representatives.

* 1.43 *

Aborigines from the Nunga, Pitjantjatjara, and Arnyamathanka communities speak of their history and experiences under white rule from 1836. Much of the volume is given to the question of cultural identity, as traditional customs were prohibited through European religious and educational institutions, and labor exploitation. The ways in which different people resisted and successfully reasserted their own identity are celebrated. This is an unusual and interesting book which tells Australian history from the perspective of some of its original inhabitants.

* 1.44 *

McLoughlin examines the complexity of relations between the Cherokee nation, missionaries, and the United States state and federal governments during the period of the first United States Indian policy. The policy intended to acculturate all 125,000 Indians east of the Mississippi within fifty years with the aim of their becoming "full and equal citizens" of America. Missionaries were integral to this policy, yet they became increasingly estranged from support for state policies over the issue of forced removals. From 1828 they developed gradual respect for Cherokee qualities. McLoughlin takes issue with previous attempts to explain Native American cultural destruction by recourse to a single economic cause; he also argues that, despite attempts, the Cherokee culture was not destroyed but transformed.

* 1.45 *

The editors have assembled a collection of papers on a topic often overlooked in development projects. Their book covers a diversity of projects situated throughout the world and deals with questions of vital importance such as the contribution indigenous peoples can make to development and conservation in terms of knowledge, practice, and participation in decision making and planning. Although this volume does not address the question of ethnocide, its importance lies in its clear demonstration that there is a viable alternative to those who argue that ethnocide is an unavoidable consequence of development.

* 1.46 *

Milner offers a comparative study of the interactions between state assimilation policies administered by the Hicksite Quaker group, and the Pawnee, Oto, and Omaha Native American societies during the 1870s. Its usefulness lies in its comparative approach, which highlights the complexity of relations between and within these groups, and between different Indian societies of the Great Plains. Milner explores how these interactions affected Quaker endeavors which, despite "good intentions," failed in their civilizing mission, largely because of the inadequacy of their powers of enforcement. Unfortunately, the failure did not leave Indian cultures intact but formed the thin-edge-of-the-wedge, preparing the ground for increasing government programs which undermined their traditional economic, social, and cultural lifestyles.

* 1.47 *

Moody has compiled a two-volume anthology of extracts from indigenous people, speaking of their own plight and fight against genocide and ethnocide resulting from development and colonialism. The material is arranged thematically, and each chapter gives voice
to a wide range of struggles throughout the world. This allows the reader to draw out similarities in protest and in processes of destruction. Volume 1 concentrates upon forms of oppression while Volume 2 focuses upon ethnic cultural and political revivals. Although no conclusions are drawn to tie the material together, these volumes provide students of human rights and development with an invaluable and extensive range of primary data. It is a challenging, unique collection which speaks straight from the heart.

* 1.48 *

In her autobiographical account of her realization of Aborigine identity, Morgan personalizes the consequences of Australian state policies of child abduction and forced assimilation. My Place is a valuable contribution.

* 1.49 *

Munzel’s detailed report outlines the plight of the Ache Indians of Paraguay. Their situation in the early 1970s, as witnessed by the author, is set in a historical context of war against the Ache since colonization. The authorities condone manhunts and massacres. The forced removal of Ache to reserves has been the solution to the problem of violence from the early 1960s. Ache held captive on the reserves are subject to white administrative abuse, such as sexual exploitation, theft of food relief, violence, and the continued sale of young children to Paraguayan as a source of cheap labor. Disease and death are commonplace and there are no sanitary facilities or preventative medical supplies. Ache culture is demonstrably suppressed, resulting in demoralization, loss of identity, and a perception of self as neither Ache nor human, but as "half-dead." Munzel makes clear that this is not a policy of modernization but the work of specific individuals who receive indirect state support. His report names names while he notes the sympathetic role of the Jesuits.

* 1.50 *

In a slim volume, the author introduces the reader to the current abuses in Tibet by Chinese imperialists. Since their invasion in 1950, the Chinese "have conducted a systematic persecution against the Tibetan people and their culture and religion" (p.7) in order to prevent uprisings of Tibetan nationalism. The author’s briefly traced history of invasion and oppression culminates in an outline of the situation since 1987. The three main methods used to destroy Tibetan identity are the division of Tibet into separately administered and renamed provinces; "brutal suppression" by the military of expressions of Tibetan culture; and the transmigration of huge numbers of Chinese into Tibet. International, particularly United States, concern is noted.

* 1.51 *

Indian Survival is a detailed study of cultural survival, deculturation and cultural integration, and transformation among Nicaraguan indigenes under Spanish colonization. Two Indian cultural types are identified—chiefdoms and tribes—which were separated geographically. The main forces of civilization and Christianization were missionaries, although Spanish administration exerted some influence on the "Western fringe" of colonization. A substantial part of the book is given to processes of deculturation, particularly Chapter 3 and Section 4, covering the period 1522-1720. Population decline due to famine, disease, and infanticide had negative repercussions upon the structure of Indian society, as did the Spanish destruction of existing forms of political organization and the exploitative grant system and the missions. Comparison is made to other South American states.

* 1.52 *

Ohland and Schneider have edited a collection of papers on the conflict between the Nicaraguan Sandinistas and the Miskitos, an indigenous people of the Atlantic Coast who demonstrated their resistance to policies of national integration by supporting the anti-Sandinista insurgency mounted from Honduras in 1982. The high fatalities inflicted on both sides prompted large scale flight into Honduras and resulted in forcible resettlement of the remaining seven to eight thousand. As a result of this drastic change in socio-economic organization, the Miskito traditional way of life has been severely threatened. The collection seeks to illustrate the complexity of relations between the Miskitos and Sandinistas which led to this situation.

Olson and Wilson analyze Native American culture and government policies since the 1880s with particular emphasis on the twentieth century. Native Americans are referred to as survivors of "centuries of cultural genocide inflicted upon them by non-Native Americans." (p.x) A distinction is made between European "Indian haters" who "denied even the humanity of Native Americans," and who pursued vigorous near-genocidal policies, and "liberal assimilationists" bent on destroying their culture. It is the policies and legislation that arose out of the latter which forms the focus of the book. The land issue is identified as one root cause of assimilationist policies.


The theme of this book is the question of nation-state building, self-discrimination, and human rights in relation to the Indians of the American continent. It is divided into four parts, dealing with Indian movements and supportive international agencies from the 1970s; theoretical analysis of Indians and the "national question," referring to state policies, Indian and pan-Indian nationalists, particularly Guatemala; an examination of the Navajo and Sioux Indian movements; and a case study of the Miskitu in Nicaragua. Ortiz’ scholarly book addresses theoretical and methodological issues in the study of a complex subject.


In a well organized pamphlet, Paine deals with a difficult issue—the effect that the construction of a hydroelectric dam in Kautokeino county in the Norwegian tundra will have for the settlers and pastoral Saami culture. Since its inception in the 1970s, the project has consistently failed to acknowledge the full consequences of the dam for the Saami. Paine argues that the oversimplistic official approach is based upon the unavailability of information and upon the neglect of that data which were readily accessible. Part II seeks to counter the official 1980 Court of Appraisal denial of detrimental consequences. The author concludes that the project will incur the loss of Saami identity, as they become "more Norwegian" and so, "less Saami." (p.94) The work is relevant to the study of ethnocide since it raises the question of intent. Despite declared State intentions to protect Saami culture, denial and ignorance have produced the converse effect.


In 1980, Price was invited by the World Bank to work as a consultant to an eminent project to construct a gravel road through Nambiquara lands in Brazil. This is the story of his involvement with the Nambiquara, from graduate anthropologist, through FUNAI (the National Indian Foundation), to World Bank representative on behalf of the Nambiquara. He chronicles the various inroads of imposing cultures upon the Nambiquara, and includes the ignorance and racism of the local peasantry, the sometimes well-intended projects of FUNAI to "pacify" the "wild" Indians (pp.11-12), and the World Bank projects. Price stresses the powerlessness of the Nambiquara.
Yanomani, and as preparation for "successful contact with the national society." (p.136)

* 1.59 *

In a highly accessible account, Read examines the contact between the Wiradjuri Aborigines of New South Wales and European missionaries and government officials from 1883. Read makes excellent use of conventional historical material and a large amount of information gained from Wiradjuri Koori to understand how the policies of the Aboriginal Protection Board affected a small Aboriginal population of about one dozen major family groups. The thrust of the policies was to destroy Aboriginal culture and to "change the blacks into whites." (p.136) The text, divided into four temporal "cycles," demonstrates that the consequences of the policies were at times unintended, yet Read draws attention to the problematic question of official intent, its common concealment, and the differences between written and applied policies. Read charts the gradual awakening of Aboriginal identity, dating it to have taken root in the 1930s.

* 1.60 *

Retboll’s collection of transcribed documents demonstrates "Indonesian atrocities in East Timor," "the responsibility of the Western democracies," and "the cover-up in the Western mass media." (preface) They are introduced by a letter from Professor Noam Chomsky to the United Nations General Assembly in 1978.

* 1.61 *

This revised edition of *Aborigines and Settlers*, published in 1972, presents a collection of documentary excerpts from nineteenth and early twentieth century European sources to explore the complexities of Aboriginal-white relations during the period of colonization. The material is well organized: each chapter addresses a different aspect of contact which is clearly introduced and explores the variety of issues involved. The book is edited by a leading authority and is an invaluable compilation of primary data which are useful to specialists and to the general reader.

* 1.62 *

*Massacres to Mining* is an impassioned but brief study of white assimilation policies and violence against Aborigines of Australia from 1788 to the present. It serves as a good introduction to understanding colonialism in Australia and clearly demonstrates that attempts to destroy Aboriginal culture have not ended. Despite the fact that it covers all of Australia, Roberts avoids excessive generality by the constant use of specific examples which ground the themes in concrete reality. The author includes recent attempts by different Aboriginal communities to reclaim their identity and their land.

* 1.63 *

The uncensored Issue 7-8 of the nationalist journal, *The Ukrainian Herald*, contains two articles, the second specifically concerned with ethnocide. An impassioned, partisan, and informative analysis of Russification policies within Ukraine uses demographic data to demonstrate that the genocidal and ethnoidal Kremlin policies were systematic solutions to expressions of Ukrainian nationalism from 1917. Forced migration and discrimination in economic, educational, cultural, and political spheres are emphasized as the main areas of ethnoidal policies. Language, rather than blood, is identified to be the psychological and cultural criteria for national identity: the replacement of Ukrainian by Russian as the medium of instruction in education, science, and the media is stressed. Contradictions between Kremlin internationalist policy statements and practices are drawn out, and it is concluded that "The heart of the matter is that Ukraine is a colony." (p.94)

* 1.64 *

This collection of papers was first presented in Session 643 at the IXth International Congress of Anthropological and Ethnological Sciences on cultural and physical destruction of indigens. Geographically focused upon Central and Latin America, the volume is divided into three sections which cover theoretical issues, the period of colonization, and the present day. A theoretical paper by John H. Bodley, "Alternatives to Ethnocide," discusses anthropological definitions of the term and the problematic role of anthropologists in exposing or disguising ethnoidal processes. Integra-
tion of indigenes into state political systems and cultural autonomy are discussed as possible alternatives to ethnocide. It also includes a wide number of case studies.

* 1.65 *

Smith’s paper is a clearly presented, critical assessment of the Pichis-Palcazu Special Project, a vast one-billion dollar state development and colonization project in central Peru. The project, which included an objective to resettle 150,000 people into the area from overcrowded Lima, overlooked the 8,000 indigenous Amuesha and Campa people in officially recognized Native Communities, and between 5,000 to 8,000 other settlers living in the region. Much of the publication vocalizes the struggle for Indian rights and discusses the viability of alternatives to specific parts of the project, such as road building, and of the integration of Indians into the national economy. The report ends with an optimistic discussion of autonomous development as a possible alternative for both the survival of Indian societies and for nation-building.

* 1.66 *

Stedman examines the portrayal of Indians in American popular culture. The foreword states that "It is an interesting and important book, interesting because of the vividness of the images..., important because those images still dominate national Indian policy." (p.ix) Added to this, Shadows of the Indian is important since it takes the reader through one clear form of cultural destruction that destroys Indian cultures, histories, and realities, and continues with a form that replaces it, the limited number of stereotypes which have been constructed by whites. Finally Stedman's book is interesting since it considers a much neglected area of destruction whose pervasive insidiousness is masked by the deceptions of media paraphernalia.

* 1.67 *

The Hmong are a tribal people of northern Thailand whose culture "now stands at the crossroads between violent change and total destruction." (p.9) In a short document, Tapp briefly outlines traditional Hmong social organization and their history of persecution under the Han Chinese until the late 1880s. He then discusses contemporary problems of opium economy; government welfare and development programs; the establishment of assimilationist refugee camps in the lowlands; deforestation; tourism, which "is contributing to the erosion of Hmong culture and cultural values." (p.52); and the lack of rights accorded to the Hmong, the majority of whom are denied citizenship.

* 1.68 *

Terzani examines the destruction of Chinese cultures since the Cultural Revolution, whose purpose was "to eliminate the vestiges of the past and to destroy the old culture in order to create a new one." (p.181) The author was expelled from China in 1984 for his outspoken criticism of Chinese policies and for pushing his journalistic enquiries into areas forbidden to outsiders. The author’s examination is colourful and insightful.

* 1.69 *

Thornton concisely summarizes the decimation and survival of two populations of American Indians from 1850 to the present day. Differences in the contact history of the Yuki and the Tolowa people with whites are illustrated. Factors suggested to explain why the larger Yuki population suffered a continual decrease which eventuated in their complete dissolution as a distinct tribal unit, while the smaller Tolowa community witnessed a resurgence from approximately mid-twentieth century, are 1) the impact of the different rates of decimation upon tribal social organization; 2) different experiences on reservations; and 3) different forms of social organization, particularly marriage, kinship systems, and patterns of residence. The main conclusion is the suggestion "that the maintenance of the "group boundaries" of an American Indian tribe ultimately determines its survival." (p.129)

* 1.70 *

Treece’s book is an angry report on the massive Greater Carajas program which is wreaking ecological, cultural, and social destruction upon an area of Brazil the size of France and Britain combined, and which
Trumbull has written a chilling, detailed study of wide
december presents urgent humanitarian and ecological problems
for the world. The rapid pace of the project has displaced thousands of the eight million people who
traditionally live in the region. Treece focuses upon
the imminent threat to the 13,000 tribal people of the
area who, despite having legal protection, suffer
economic, social, cultural, and physical destruction
from contact with non-Indian society as officials waive
their legislative responsibilities. The role of the major
investors—the World Bank and the EEC—is criticized
for lack of serious consultation with Indians and
irresponsibility over human rights. Treece argues that
recognition of tribal land rights is the only way to
ensure their physical and cultural survival.

* 1.71 *
Trumbull, Colin. *The Mountain People.* London:

In a personalized account of an anthropologist's
field study among the small Ik community in the
mountainous regions bordering Uganda, Sudan, and
Kenya, Trumbull describes the distressing psychological
damage experienced by an entire community who
suffered rapid and drastic change of socio-economic
organization, which created unstable social relations,
famine, total despondency, neglect of sanitation, and
death. The concluding recommendations reek of despair
and offer no real hope for either survival or salvation.
Trumbull has written a chilling, detailed study of wide
significance for those concerned with the experience
of collective social and psychological death rather than
with official policies.

* 1.72 *
UNESCO. *Informe Final: Reunion de Expertos sobre
Etnodesarrollo y Etnocidio en America Latina, 7-11
de Diciembre de 1981; FLACSO, SanJose, Costa Rica.

This is the final report of the UNESCO Conference
of San Jose on Ethnic Development and Ethnocide
in Latin America, held in December 1981.

* 1.73 *
Valkeapaa, Nils-Aslak. *Greetings from Lapland.*

Valkeapaa describes the current plight of the
indigenous Saami in Nordic countries which are
normally so progressive on human rights issues. The
Saami author identifies four main threats: development
projects; the military, as the region is used as a base
for tens of thousands of NATO forces; tourism, which
ridicules and denigrates Saami culture; and state
education, which imposes Western values and languages.
The book includes struggles of the Saami to retain
their land and culture. The direct and magical style
invites the reader into the lived culture; it also includes
factual and more academic information and discussion.

* 1.74 *
Walter, Lynn. *Ethnicity, Economy and the State in
Ecuador.* Aalborg, Denmark: Aalborg University Press,

Walter’s short paper on the integration of Indians
into mainstream Ecuadorian life was presented at the
Aalborg University Center. Attempts to forge a
homogenous Ecuadorian identity concomitantly with
state development projects deny the existence of distinct
Indian cultures and identities and seek their assimilation.
In the words of Guillermo Rodriguez Lara, a
former president, "'There is no more Indian problem...we all become white men when we accept
the goals of the national culture'." (p.23)

* 1.75 *
Whitten, Norman E., Jr. *Sacha Runa: Ethnicity and
Adaptation of Ecuadorian Jungle Quicha.* Urbana,
Chicago, and London: University of Illinois Press,

Whitten has written an in-depth ethnographic
analysis of the Canel Quicha, the native peoples of
Pastza and Tenas provinces of Ecuador. The focus lies
in the effect upon the Indians of state nationalism as
agrarian reform and cultural homogenization. These
deny Quicha identity and officially subsume them under
the general national category of mestizo. Paradoxically,
processes of homogenization have re-emphasized ethnic
boundaries: ethnogenesis and pan-Andean identities
have been promoted. The government denies ethnocidal
consequences of state nationalism and considers it an
outcome of international petroleum company exploitation
during the 1960s. Whitten warns of a possible
future genocide of the Quicha, whose situation is
precarious.

* 1.76 *
Witness to Cultural Genocide. *First-Hand Reports on
Rumania’s Minority Policies Today.* New York:
American Transylvanian Federation, Inc. and the
Committee for Human Rights in Rumania, n.d.

The articles, letters, and memoranda of personalized
accounts in this collection describe Rumanian policies
towards the Hungarian minority in Transylvania. They speak of the oppression and torture of Hungarian
intellectuals who were conceived of as a threat to
Rumanian dominance of Transylvania before the 1989
revolution and of the widespread discrimination against
Hungarian language, education, health, employment,
and housing. The crux of the problem lies in Transylvania’s troublesome history of annexation to Hungary
and Rumania. The Hungarian minority were identified
as a potential irredentist nationalist threat. Paper I discusses post-1968 policies within the context of international legal codes and suggests a gradual program of "psychological torture...and genocide." (p.20) Paper II focuses on educational, artistic, and religious institutions.

* 1.77 *


The World Bank's Office of Environmental Affairs examines the need to re-think its policy on funding development projects which often have devastating effects upon tribal peoples. The proposals argue that there should be a gradual inclusion of isolated tribal groups into the national society and that tribal peoples should benefit economically from World Bank assisted projects. Section 3 considers the "Prerequisites for Ethnic Identity and Survival" in terms of land, health, and cultural autonomy.